



SCOTTISH EXECUTIVE

Crime and Criminal Justice

Liquor Licensing and Public Disorder: Review of Literature on the Impact of Licensing and Other Controls/Audit of Local Initiatives



**LIQUOR LICENSING AND PUBLIC DISORDER:
REVIEW OF LITERATURE ON THE IMPACT OF
LICENSING AND OTHER CONTROLS / AUDIT OF
LOCAL INITIATIVES**

REID HOWIE ASSOCIATES LTD

Scottish Executive Social Research
2003

Further copies of this report are available priced £5.00. Cheques should be made payable to The Stationery Office Ltd and addressed to:

The Stationery Office Bookshop
71 Lothian Road
Edinburgh
EH3 9AZ

Tel: 0870-606-5566
Fax: 0870-606-5588

**The views expressed in this report are those of the
researcher and do not necessarily represent those of the
Department or Scottish Ministers**

© Crown Copyright 2003

Limited extracts from the text may be produced provided the source is acknowledged. For more extensive reproduction, please write to the Office of the Chief Researcher at Scottish Executive, St. Andrew's House, Regent Road, Edinburgh, EH1 3DG

TABLE OF CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	i
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND	1
CURRENT WORK IN SCOTLAND	1
The role of the Nicholson Committee	1
The need for information	2
The aims of the study	2
THE WORK UNDERTAKEN	3
THE LINKS BETWEEN ALCOHOL, CRIME AND DISORDER	5
Defining alcohol-related crime and disorder	5
Alcohol and crime	5
Tackling alcohol-related crime and disorder	8
CHAPTER 2: REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE	10
REGULATION AND CONTROL OF ALCOHOL	10
INITIATIVES TO CONTROL LICENSING/AVAILABILITY OF ALCOHOL	11
Licensing controls	11
Advertising controls, pricing and taxation	18
REGULATION OF CONSUMPTION, INITIATIVES FOR SPECIFIC GROUPS OR CRIMES, AND ENFORCEMENT OF EXISTING LAW	20
Targeting groups or areas	20
Information gathering and dissemination	23
Controls on location of drinking	25
Drink driving	27
Alcohol as a defence	30
INITIATIVES RELATING TO THE ENVIRONMENT/CONTEXT OF ALCOHOL CONSUMPTION	30
Managing the environment	31
The physical environment	35
Other measures	37
OVERVIEW	37
CHAPTER 3: AUDIT OF CURRENT INITIATIVES IN SCOTLAND	38
RESPONDENTS	38
Types of organisation reporting initiatives	39
Types of initiatives	42
INITIATIVES TO CONTROL LICENSING/AVAILABILITY OF ALCOHOL	44
The target behaviours	45
Specific examples	46
Perceptions of success	49
REGULATION OF CONSUMPTION, INITIATIVES FOR SPECIFIC GROUPS OR CRIMES, AND ENFORCEMENT OF EXISTING LAW	51
Target behaviours	52
Specific examples	53
Perceptions of success	58

INITIATIVES RELATING TO THE ENVIRONMENT/CONTEXT OF ALCOHOL CONSUMPTION	63
Target behaviours	64
Specific examples	65
Perceptions of success	69
OTHER WORK	72
OVERVIEW	74
CHAPTER 4: SUMMARY OF ISSUES RAISED	75
THE EVIDENCE PRESENTED	75
Addressing the general sale and consumption of alcohol	75
Addressing the consumption of alcohol by particular groups and in particular locations	77
Changing the drinking environment and the context of consumption	78
THE IMPLICATIONS OF THE FINDINGS	78
The need for further research	79
BIBLIOGRAPHY	80

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

1. The Nicholson Committee is currently carrying out a review of liquor licensing in Scotland. During the period of its operation, the Committee has a remit to:

“review all aspects of liquor licensing law and practice in Scotland, with particular reference to the implications for health and public disorder; to recommend changes in the public interest and to report accordingly”.

2. As part of that process, the Committee is gathering evidence to inform its work. This research was commissioned in order to inform the work of a particular sub-group which is considering issues relating to alcohol-related crime and disorder. The research had two purposes:

- To review existing literature relating to initiatives which undertake to tackle alcohol-related crime and disorder.
- To carry out an audit of existing initiatives in Scotland which aim to tackle alcohol-related disorder.

3. The findings presented in the report in relation to each of these objectives focus upon efforts to control the availability of alcohol or the context in which alcohol is consumed, rather than upon efforts to reduce the underlying causes of alcohol misuse.

4. The literature review was carried out through library searches of relevant journals and publications, and through the use of recent publications which were developed in Scotland in order to inform the Plan for Action on Alcohol Problems¹. Specific material was also provided by some of the key contacts during the research (e.g. The Portman Group and the Scottish Beer and Pubs Association (SBPA), formerly the Brewers’ and Licensed Retailers’ Association).

5. The audit of initiatives in Scotland was carried out by circulating a pro forma to organisations at a national and local level, which were identified as likely to be involved in relevant initiatives. Information about the nature of the work taking place was sought, as was information about the impact of the work. A descriptive account of the findings is provided in this report.

6. The report is in a number of chapters. Chapter 1 outlines the background and the overall context of the work. Further details of the methodology are provided, and some of the literature relating to the links between alcohol and crime / disorder is explored. While it is not suggested that alcohol directly causes crime and disorder, it is recognised that there is a complex relationship between these issues, which many initiatives have sought to address.

¹ Referred to hereafter as the Plan for Action

7. Chapter 2 presents the findings of the literature review, and Chapter 3 the results of the audit of initiatives in Scotland. In each case, the discussion focuses upon three broad types of work which are seen to be most relevant:

- Initiatives to control the availability of alcohol through licensing (including, for example, the imposition of conditions upon licenses, work to address opening hours or other aspects of the sale of alcohol)
- Regulation of aspects of consumption, initiatives to tackle specific groups or crimes and the enforcement of existing law (including, for example, drinking in certain locations, under age drinking, drink driving, etc)²
- Regulation of the environment / context of alcohol consumption (including, for example, staff training and registration, use of toughened glass and design changes.)

8. It is recognised that there is some overlap between these categories, but this overall framework provided the basis for more detailed consideration of the range of work which was identified, and the main purpose was to ensure that a descriptive account of relevant work could be provided.

9. Chapter 4 then draws together the implications of all of the findings. The report does not draw definitive conclusions in relation to these issues, as it is suggested that this will be carried out by the Nicholson Committee when the findings are considered at the next stage of the process. Instead, a number of the issues raised are summarised, pointing forward briefly to their implications for future work.

10. In terms of key findings, the report notes that there have been a range of studies of the effectiveness of measures to regulate and control alcohol sales and consumption. The evidence is not, however, always clear, with a need for some caution in applying the results directly to Scotland. The literature review does, nonetheless, provide an indication of measures which can be seen to have an impact upon crime and disorder, and the report suggests that this, taken alongside the findings from work undertaken in Scotland, can provide useful evidence to inform the work of the Committee.

11. In terms of the general restriction of alcohol consumption, it is suggested that there is evidence to support the idea that longer hours of alcohol sales may be linked to increased problems with alcohol-related crime and disorder, although the evidence from the UK and Scotland is mixed on this issue. Studies have also suggested that staggered closing times (and curfews) may have an impact on disorder, although it is stressed that local circumstances must be taken into account in developing such work. In Scotland, examples were found in the audit of measures to tackle the general availability of alcohol through the imposition of conditions upon extension of opening hours and the provision of local guidelines about permitted extensions. A small number of examples of the use of curfews were also highlighted.

² It is recognised that categories 1 and 2 are similar, and both involve regulation and control of the availability of alcohol, but the focus in the second category is more specifically upon law enforcement and regulation for particular groups of people or types of crime.

12. There is also some evidence that the age at which young people can buy and consume alcohol on licensed premises has an impact upon juvenile crime. It has been suggested that *lowering* the legal drinking age can raise the levels of male juvenile crime, and *raising* the age can, for example, reduce alcohol-related car crashes and fatalities. Some studies also suggest, however, that lowering the age at which people can buy and drink alcohol on licensed premises can reduce the likelihood of young people drinking in unsafe and unsupervised locations.

13. There is evidence of a link between the number of outlets in an area and the levels of alcohol-related problems, and there is data to suggest that limitation of numbers may have an impact on alleviating problems. There is also some evidence that different types of outlet may experience different levels and types of alcohol-related crime / disorder. Some areas also noted that they considered outlet density when new licenses were granted.

14. In terms of issues which are outwith the remit of the legislation in Scotland, the report also notes that there is currently a lack of evidence regarding the impact of alcohol advertising on alcohol-related harm. There is, however, perceived to be a link between alcohol price and consumption, but little direct evidence (with the exception of one study) of the impact of this upon alcohol-related crime and disorder.

15. The second category related to initiatives to address the consumption of alcohol by particular groups and in particular locations, and the research found evidence of success of a number of measures. The findings from the literature review suggested, for example, that high profile policing and enforcement of the law relating to under age drinking can be linked to a reduction in the number of crimes and arrests (although there is mixed evidence of the impact of test purchasing³). In terms of initiatives in Scotland, young people were identified frequently in the audit as a target group, and there were many examples of the operation of local proof of age schemes.

16. High profile policing around some licensed premises has also been associated with a reduction in arrests and crime rates, and it has been suggested that the enforcement of the law relating to serving alcohol to people who are intoxicated may also impact upon crime and disorder. A number of initiatives were also reported in Scotland as targeting specific areas which were seen to be “hotspots”.

17. There was also some evidence in the literature review to support the value of community enforcement programmes. It was suggested, however, that the effect of these may not be sustained in the longer term, and that there may be a need for them to be combined with more formal measures.

18. The research found considerable material relating to “Pubwatch” schemes, and these appear to have had some success in the reduction of alcohol-related disorder, sometimes being used alongside other measures (for example, the dissemination of information, the use of exclusion orders and the use of CCTV). A number of examples of Pubwatch schemes were found across Scotland. One example was found of an area in which licensees had a direct radio link to CCTV operators, and there was

³ That is, covert testing of vendors through the use of decoy purchasers

a general perception that there had been a reduction in crime and an increase in public safety with these schemes.

19. In terms of the regulation of the location in which people can drink alcohol, the research identified some evidence to suggest that the prohibition of drinking in public places has had some success in addressing alcohol-related crime and disorder, particularly, again, where this was combined with other measures.

20. Actions to address drink driving described in the report and identified in the literature review have also been generally found to be successful, particularly when they are enforced vigorously and have a high public profile.

21. In the third overall category, exploring initiatives which involved changing the drinking environment and the context of consumption, again there was evidence of the value of some types of work. The literature review noted that many aspects of the layout and operation of licensed premises can contribute to alcohol-related aggression. There are, for example, identifiable aspects of the design of premises which could reduce alcohol-related crime and disorder, and there were some instances of initiatives of this type in Scotland.

22. There was also evidence to suggest that the provision of training to licensees, servers and door stewards (particularly where this was backed by management, used to enforce legislation and repeated regularly), could help to prevent and deal with alcohol-related crime/disorder. This was the commonest type of initiative in this category identified in Scotland, with work taking place in many different areas to provide such training (often through “Servewise” provision⁴). The difficulties, however, of securing participation in training when this is on a voluntary basis were noted.

23. There was found to be little evidence of the impact of health warning information upon alcohol-related crime and disorder, and the literature review suggested that this was considered unlikely to have a significant impact in isolation from other measures. There were few examples of the provision of such information in Scotland. There were also few examples of the control of inappropriate promotions (although the evidence suggested that such promotions can contribute to alcohol-related disorder, and organisations such as the Scottish Beer and Pubs Association (SBPA) encourage good practice in relation to the control of these, with a good practice guide being developed).

24. Finally, in terms of the use of specific materials in licensed premises, the research found some evidence from the literature to suggest that the use of toughened glass can have an impact on the number of “glassing” attacks and facial injuries. Again, there was also evidence of such initiatives taking place in parts of Scotland, although it was noted that there is not always consistency in the standard of the materials used.

⁴ ‘Servewise’ is a programme to provide training, through a network of centres, to those serving alcohol

25. The implications of the findings presented in this report will require to be considered in terms of the ways in which future legislation can promote the types of work which have the clearest impact upon alcohol-related crime and disorder. The research identified a need for the evaluation of those initiatives which are undertaken, as there was found to be a general lack of such information. While this report provides information to inform the current work of the Nicholson Committee, the development and use of clear measures of the impact of initiatives upon alcohol related crime and disorder will assist in future planning in the longer term.

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND

1.1 This research was commissioned in order to provide evidence to inform the work of the Nicholson Committee, which is undertaking a review of liquor licensing in Scotland. The Committee was appointed to:

“review all aspects of liquor licensing law and practice in Scotland, with particular reference to the implications for health and public disorder; to recommend changes in the public interest and to report accordingly”.

This research provides information to inform the work of the Committee in relation to initiatives which have been undertaken to address alcohol-related crime and disorder internationally, nationally and locally.

CURRENT WORK IN SCOTLAND

1.2 There is considerable work currently being undertaken in relation to alcohol in Scotland. In addition to the review of liquor licensing, the Scottish Executive Health Department (Substance Misuse Division) has recently completed a large scale consultation process in order to inform the development of a ‘Plan for Action on Alcohol Misuse’. This involved the collection of written evidence, the development of specific research studies, the use of other literature and the use of an on-line discussion forum.

1.3 One of the issues explored within the consultation process was the identification of key current concerns relating to alcohol misuse and perceived changes which might be required to address these. A national forum, the Scottish Advisory Committee on Alcohol Misuse (SACAM) has been in place since April 1999, and has been involved in work to develop the “Plan for Action on Alcohol Problems” published by the Scottish Executive in January 2002, and has had close involvement in the consultation process which underpinned the work.

The Role of the Nicholson Committee

1.4 The consultation conducted for the Nicholson Committee always recognised that the review of liquor licensing would be taking place in order to consider specific issues relating to licensing. The last review of liquor licensing in Scotland took place in 1976, and the Licensing (Scotland) Act 1976 has been in place since that time. The Act covers the sale and supply of alcohol, and allows Licensing Boards (with responsibility for licensing in the local area) to make local byelaws.

1.5 It is recognised, however, that there is a need to consider whether the current legislation remains appropriate, given the changes which have taken place in Scotland in the last 25 years. There have been many changes to the ways in which alcohol is perceived, sold, promoted and consumed. Examples include changes in attitudes to drinking, the increased availability of alcohol (with a growth in the number of licenses

and the growing use of promotions) and changes to patterns of drinking (such as “binge drinking”). There has also been a growing concern over the impact of harmful drinking on health and on society. In this context, one of the specific areas of concern which has been identified is the link between alcohol misuse and crime.

1.6 The Nicholson Committee will consider the implications of all of the issues identified during the period of its deliberations. The committee will be involved in the collection and consideration of a range of evidence which will assist in the review, and in the identification of recommendations. This report forms part of that evidence.

The need for information

1.7 All of the work which has been undertaken in relation to alcohol has placed considerable emphasis on the need for initiatives to be evidence-based. One of the areas in which a need for information has already been identified relates to the reduction of alcohol-related crime and disorder.

1.8 A specific sub-group of the Committee is considering issues relating to liquor licensing and public order, with the links between alcohol misuse and crime identified as a specific area of concern.

1.9 This report provides information to that sub-group, both in relation to the literature relating to the broad picture of initiatives to tackle alcohol-related crime and disorder, and the findings of an audit of current and recent initiatives to tackle this issue in Scotland.

The aims of the study

1.10 The aims of this study were twofold:

- To carry out a literature review of initiatives used in other jurisdictions to control the supply and/or context in which alcohol is sold, and to examine evidence of the impact which these initiatives have had
- To carry out an audit of current and recent initiatives in Scotland to summarise local work to reduce alcohol-related disorder across the country, identifying current and recent efforts and reporting the findings of any evaluations of the impact of these efforts

Both the literature review and the audit focused upon efforts to control the availability of alcohol and / or the context in which alcohol is consumed, rather than on efforts to address the underlying causes of alcohol misuse. Both focused on the perceived impact of such initiatives on alcohol related crime and disorder.

THE WORK UNDERTAKEN

1.11 The way in which the material for each part of the study was gathered is outlined briefly below. As the methodology involved very basic and straightforward collection of information, this is presented in the body of the text rather than in a separate chapter.

Literature review

1.12 The literature review focused specifically on the identification of initiatives, which had been undertaken in other jurisdictions which appeared to have had an impact on alcohol related crime and disorder.

1.13 Although there is a large volume of material relating to the links between alcohol and crime, this review concentrated particularly on evidence of the initiatives which have attempted to address disorder and crime through regulation of alcohol supply and the drinking environment.

1.14 This information was gathered through a search of library and journal sources (e.g. Edinburgh University Library, The British Library and the National Library of Scotland), as well as through the use of other research reports which were published in January 2002 alongside the Plan for Action on Alcohol Problems⁵. On the basis of all of the literature which was available, the report attempted to identify those approaches which appeared to have had a demonstrable impact upon alcohol-related crime and disorder.

1.15 Given the wide ranging nature of the review, all initiatives explored were included, even where there were factors which might make them less appropriate for adoption in Scotland. Chapter 2 of the report presents the findings of this review⁶.

Audit of initiatives in Scotland

⁵ Reid-Howie Associates Ltd “Towards a Plan for Action on Alcohol Misuse : Responses to the Written Consultation” Scottish Executive (2001);
Save the Children Scotland “Consultation with Children and Young People on the Scottish Executive’s Plan for Action on Alcohol Misuse” (2001)
NFO System Three “Alcohol Misusers and Their Families and Friends” Scottish Executive (2001)
NFO System Three “Scottish Opinion Survey Alcohol Misuse : Tabulations” Scottish Executive (2001)
Catalyst Health Economics Consultants Ltd : “Alcohol Misuse in Scotland : Trends and Costs” Scottish Executive (2001) Referred to as “The Catalyst Report” or the “Trends and Costs” study
University of Aberdeen, HEBS and University of York : “Cost Effective Measures to Reduce Alcohol Misuse in Scotland : A Literature Review” Scottish Executive (2001) Referred to as the “Cost-Effectiveness” study
MacAskill, S., Cooke, E. and Hastings, G. : “Prevention of Alcohol Misuse : Informing the Strategy – Report of a Two Day Deliberative Expert Seminar” University of Strathclyde Centre for Social Marketing (2001)
Sewel, K. “International Alcohol Policies : A Literature Review” Scottish Executive (2001) Referred to as the “International Literature Review”

⁶ It is important to note here that the authors of some of the literature which is included in the review approach the issue from a particular policy perspective, based upon their own specific area of interest (e.g. the alcohol industry, public health concerns etc.) This should be borne in mind when considering the evidence which is presented.

1.16 The second part of the work involved identifying current and recent local work in Scotland which had been carried out to reduce alcohol-related disorder. It also sought information about the impact and success of these measures.

1.17 A pro forma was circulated to a range of organisations at a national and local level as follows:

- Police
- Licensing Boards
- Local authority policy units
- Alcohol Misuse Co-ordinating Committees
- Drinkwise Committees / Alcohol Focus Scotland
- Major alcohol industry / business organisations
- Relevant voluntary organisations
- Health Boards and Local Health Councils
- Social Inclusion Partnerships
- Community Safety Partnerships
- Other relevant local partnerships

1.18 The pro forma requested information about relevant work taking place in relation to:

- Under age drinking
- Other age restrictions on alcohol purchase / consumption
- Licensing hours
- Drinking up times
- Volume / concentration of licensed premises (on and off sales)
- Promotions
- Staff training
- Pubwatch
- Other schemes to improve safety

1.19 For each initiative, the following was also requested:

- A brief outline of the nature of the work undertaken
- The impact of the work
- Contact details

1.20 The information provided a picture of current and recent work which has been undertaken in Scotland, and this is summarised in Chapter 3. The implications of the findings from both parts of the work are then summarised in Chapter 4. The remainder of this chapter briefly sets the work in the broader context of alcohol-related crime and disorder.

THE LINKS BETWEEN ALCOHOL, CRIME AND DISORDER

1.21 Although this research did not review the extensive literature relating to the links between alcohol, crime and disorder, it is useful to outline briefly some of the key issues which have been raised in this debate in order to set the findings from Chapters 2 and 3 in context.

Defining alcohol-related crime and disorder

1.22 It should be recognised at the outset that there is a current debate about the definition of “alcohol-related crime and disorder”. This issue has been explored in detail in a recent report for The Portman Group (SIRC, 2002). This report points out that it is often assumed that the use of the term “alcohol-related” implies that there is a direct causal relationship between alcohol and some types of behaviour which are seen to constitute crime and disorder. There is, however, a lack of evidence of such a direct relationship, and the use of the term “alcohol-related” is more usually employed to indicate behaviour where alcohol is a contributory factor in the outcome, along with other influences. The same report notes, nevertheless, that this can extend to a broad definition that includes situations in which those involved in the behaviour have been drinking.

1.23 The variations in definition clearly lead to difficulties in definitive measurement of the extent of alcohol-related crime and disorder, and should be borne in mind throughout this report.

1.24 The purpose of this report, however, is not to measure the extent of alcohol-related crime and disorder, but to identify the nature of initiatives undertaken, and the perceived effectiveness of these, on the basis of existing evidence.

1.25 Against this background, the report considers those initiatives which have, in the view of organisations undertaking such work, been undertaken to address alcohol-related crime and disorder in Scotland, allowing organisations themselves to identify these initiatives. Whilst the limitations of clear measurement of the impact of these are acknowledged, the findings can nonetheless provide useful information to assist the deliberations of the Nicholson Committee.

Alcohol and crime

1.26 While it is not suggested that there is a direct causal link between alcohol and crime / disorder, the Home Office (2000), amongst other authors, suggests that a substantial amount of crime is committed while the individual is “under the influence of alcohol”.

1.27 A report prepared for the Plan for Action on Alcohol Misuse⁷ also noted that:

⁷ “Towards a Plan for Action on Alcohol Misuse” HMSO (2001) – referred to as the “Plan for Action”

“it has been found that there is often a strong correlation between alcohol and aggression, and alcohol can affect the ability to take a range of social or situational signals into account”.

The same report noted, however, that it is also important to recognise that alcohol “does not, in itself, cause disorder”⁸, nor does it cause specific forms of behaviour such as domestic abuse⁹. It is, however, suggested that alcohol can exacerbate violence or abuse.

1.28 Deehan (1999) provides a detailed account of the complex links between alcohol and crime, suggesting that, although it is not always a causal factor, it can contribute to and be linked with crime. A number of links are identified (Purser, 1995).

- It can cause the crime to be committed (in the case of drink driving or drunkenness offences)
- It can be linked to crimes against licensing laws (e.g. selling to, or serving people under age, serving people who are intoxicated)
- It can be a disinhibitor (e.g. where it is used for courage during an offence)
- It can be linked to crimes committed because of an alcohol problem (e.g. to obtain money or alcohol)
- It can be presented in mitigation as an explanation for criminal behaviour

1.29 It is also suggested that alcohol can be linked to aggression, and although:

“there is not a direct pharmacological link between alcohol and violent behaviour... it is more likely that alcohol increases aggression by influencing the social and cognitive processes” (Home Office, 1999 citing Bushman, 1997).

1.30 The report prepared for the Plan for Action on Alcohol Misuse suggested that alcohol can impact on crime in a number of ways:

- Through offences relating to alcohol (being drunk and disorderly, drunk and incapable, driving while under the influence of alcohol, or being drunk in charge of a child)
- Selling alcohol to people who are under the legal age to purchase this
- Committing offences whilst under the influence of alcohol

1.31 A Home Office report¹⁰, for example, noted that:

“it has been estimated that 40% of violent crime, 78% of assaults and 88% of criminal damage cases are committed while the offender is under the influence of alcohol”.

⁸ Berkowitz, 1993, quoted in “Drinkwise” materials

⁹ “National Strategy to Address Domestic Abuse in Scotland” Scottish Partnership on Domestic Abuse (2000)

¹⁰ “Tackling Alcohol Related Crime, Disorder and Nuisance” HMSO (2000)

The same report pointed out that disorder around licensed premises is linked to alcohol and that many people may avoid city centres in the evening at weekends because of fear of “alcohol related violence or intimidation”.

1.32 Similarly, one of several specialist reports¹¹ commissioned to inform the Plan for Action noted that a study had found that around 64% of offenders and 44% of victims of crime had been drinking at the time of a violent offence. The summary of evidence report noted that:

“The same study suggested that police time accounted for 75% of the costs of alcohol misuse to the Scottish criminal justice system and emergency services (with prosecutions, custodial sentences and drink driving campaigning accounting for the remainder) ... the Catalyst study estimated that the cost to the criminal justice system and emergency services associated with alcohol misuse in Scotland is £267.9 million per annum.”

1.33 A submission by a senior police officer to a SACAM expert seminar¹², also stated that alcohol is a factor in 60-70% of homicides, 75% of stabbings, 50% of fights and 50% of all crime in the U.K. The summary of evidence report suggested that :

“links to crime emerged consistently across evidence strands as a major concern”.

1.34 The Home Office “Alcohol and Crime Toolkit”¹³ also notes the following:

- Alcohol is a factor in 40% of recorded domestic violence incidents.
- Victims of violence judged offenders to be under the influence of alcohol in 40% of incidents and in 53% of stranger violence
- 19% of all violent incidents occur in or around pubs or clubs, rising to a third of violent incidents where the offender is a stranger
- Drinking in bars is associated with greater violence or aggressive behaviour than in other drinking settings, such as private clubs or restaurants
- Alcohol consumption increases the vulnerability of an individual to assault
- Young males aged 16-24 are much more likely to be the perpetrators of alcohol-related violence than any other group

1.35 These data relating to the links between alcohol and crime were supported in perceptions identified in specialist research carried out with young people in a Save the Children study¹⁴, and with alcohol misusers, their friends and families in a study

¹¹ The ‘Catalyst Report’

¹² DCC Tom Wood “Alcohol and Policing” in MacAskill, S., Cooke, E. and Hastings, G. : “Prevention of Alcohol Misuse : Informing the Strategy” Report Supplement

¹³ “Crime Reduction Toolkits: Alcohol and Crime” London (2001) HMSO (Figures refer to England & Wales only).

¹⁴ Save the Children Scotland “Consultation with Children and Young People on the Scottish Executive’s Plan for Action on Alcohol Misuse” (2001)

by NFO System Three¹⁵. The young people, for example, identified links between alcohol and crime such as:

- Vandalism
- Abusing people and swearing
- Getting drunk and disorderly
- Getting arrested
- Wrecking or stealing cars
- Lighting fires
- Stealing

1.36 The NFO System Three study also found that the personal experiences of many of those involved suggested links between alcohol and aggression, and an omnibus survey with a representative sample of the Scottish population¹⁶ found that 70% of all respondents agreed with the statement that “most violent crime is alcohol-related”.

Tackling alcohol-related¹⁷ crime and disorder

1.37 Given these perceived links, it is argued that both the volume of alcohol consumed and the drinking environment can contribute to the likelihood of alcohol-related crime and disorder, and that tackling these issues may have an impact upon the incidence of crime and disorder. This has led to initiatives in the following broad areas:

- Addressing the general sale and consumption of alcohol through licensing restrictions and initiatives
- Addressing the consumption of alcohol by particular groups and in particular locations
- Changing the drinking environment

It should be noted that a large amount of preventive educational and awareness raising work has also been undertaken to tackle the perceived causes of alcohol problems, but these are largely outwith the remit of this report.

1.38 Similarly, there is considerable work taking place in relation to the provision of services to meet the needs of people who have problems with alcohol. There is a wide range of literature which relates both to preventive work and to service provision, often identifying innovative work in relation to these. This report does not, however, focus upon this (as this is again outwith the direct remit of the study).

¹⁵ NFO System Three “Alcohol Misusers and Their Families and Friends” Scottish Executive (2001)

¹⁶ NFO System Three “Scottish Opinion Survey Alcohol Misuse : Tabulations” Scottish Executive (2001)

¹⁷ It should be acknowledged here that there is currently no common definition of “alcohol-related” but is taken in this report to mean crime and disorder in which alcohol is seen to play a part.

1.39 It should also be noted that the written consultation and much of the literature stressed the need for partnership working to address alcohol-related issues. This was recognised in the range of organisations which were provided with the pro forma, and was identified in a number of the responses, through which many positive examples of partnership working were highlighted. Against this background, the next chapter presents the findings of the literature review.

CHAPTER 2: REVIEW OF LITERATURE

2.1 This chapter reviews existing literature relating to the regulation and control, of alcohol sale and consumption, as a means of addressing alcohol-related crime and disorder.

REGULATION AND CONTROL OF ALCOHOL

2.2 Initiatives to control and regulate alcohol consumption have often focused upon legislative changes, the enforcement of these legislative changes and other controls.

2.3 Raistrick et al (1999) suggest that the current approach to licensing in the UK reflects the ambiguous position of alcohol, as a potential cause of harm, whilst linked to “leisure and pleasure”. In terms of controlling the availability of alcohol through licensing regulation, on the one hand, measures to limit the availability of alcohol have been implemented (with a view to reducing the problems caused, “particularly disturbances of the peace”). On the other hand, however, there is also resistance to such measures (given the links to social activity), and a “constantly shifting balance between the two approaches”.

2.4 There has, therefore, been considerable debate about whether the focus of action to address alcohol problems should be upon the population as a whole, or upon those groups and individuals who have problems with alcohol. This has been reflected in the debate relating to control and regulation issues, with some who suggest that these measures should be used to reduce per capita consumption, while others suggest that they should target specific drinking patterns or target groups.

2.5 The cost-effectiveness study commissioned for the Plan for Action noted that there is evidence from a review of policy strategies in other countries to suggest that:

“reducing alcohol consumption in the general population or in high risk populations are equally effective in preventing alcohol related problems”.

2.6 The international literature review suggested that:

“in general, there is an identifiable trend away from efforts aimed solely at decreasing total population alcohol consumption, coupled with concentration on policies aimed at combating use among specific groups and in specific settings”.

2.7 The Plan for Action has adopted an approach which recognises that there is a need to raise general awareness of alcohol, and to offer protection from some of the problematic consequences of alcohol misuse, while undertaking particular work with those who “misuse” alcohol.

2.8 It is clearly important to identify the most appropriate ways in which measures that focus upon the regulation and control of alcohol can contribute to addressing

these goals, and this (as with other work to address alcohol problems) will be undertaken in the context of the following review.

INITIATIVES TO CONTROL LICENSING / AVAILABILITY OF ALCOHOL

2.9 Many of the initiatives described below relate to approaches which affect alcohol consumption generally.

2.10 The evidence report for the Plan for Action noted that controls on licensing can have an impact on general alcohol sales through:

- The regulation of hours
- The regulation of where alcohol can be sold
- The age at which alcohol can be bought

2.11 Changes in these areas can affect the availability (and potentially the consumption) of alcohol, thus being seen by many to have the potential to impact upon alcohol-related crime and disorder. Raistrick et al (1999) highlight “the prevention of crime, violence and public disorder” as one of the reasons for the use of regulatory measures¹⁸ and point out that it remains important to examine the role of restricting availability in “minimising harm” and moderating

“specific patterns of drinking which are more commonly associated with adverse consequences”.

Views, however, in relation to the relative emphasis on regulation and control vary, and there are some overall issues which should be recognised in exploring the effectiveness of licensing controls.

Licensing controls

2.12 Raistrick et al (1999) highlight the importance of recognising that:

“although availability has a broad impact on alcohol consumption and problems, it is widely accepted that the link is complex and that the consequences of increasing or relaxing controls are often difficult to predict.”

This should be borne in mind when considering the evidence presented here.

¹⁸ It should be noted here that Raistrick et al (1999) provide a very detailed summary of much of the literature and research evidence in relation to the issues under consideration, as that publication summarises the evidence base for the development of an alcohol policy. Many of the studies cited in this review are identified from Raistrick et al’s summary (although not highlighted as such individually). The chapter relating to “Regulation” was sent specifically by one of the authors of the publication in response to the request for information relating to current initiatives for the audit. This suggests their willingness for the material to be summarised to inform the deliberations of the Nicholson Committee.

2.13 In terms of the general availability of evidence of these measures, the cost-effectiveness study identified no studies of the costs of initiatives of this type, but reviewed evidence relating to their effectiveness and this, alongside other material, is summarised below.

2.14 The cost-effectiveness study found that there was generally unclear evidence, especially in the UK, about licensing controls and

“relatively few studies of licensing interventions”.

2.15 Raistrick et al (1999) suggest that it is difficult to measure the impact of licensing law reform, because:

- The law is not a single measure, but a number of regulations / restrictions. Different reforms may be introduced together, with different purposes, making it difficult to identify the effect of distinct actions
- The law has a cultural dimension which is hard to measure. Different countries have different drinking cultures, making comparison difficult
- Where changes are made to legislation, enforcement varies.
- Indicators for measurement vary, with an existing overall lack of quality data

2.16 The cost-effectiveness study also noted (and this should be borne in mind throughout the literature review) that caution is required in the interpretation of these findings. This caution can relate both to the limitations of some of the data and to the fact that, where studies have been conducted outwith the UK, they may be less directly applicable to UK policy and legislation. Against this background, however, the findings which were available are considered below.

Licensing hours

2.17 One of the key areas in which there is the opportunity for licensing regulation and control is in relation to licensing hours. Raistrick et al (1999) note that the trend since the 1960s has been towards the relaxation of licensing legislation in Scotland, with many of the recommendations of the Clayson Committee (SHHD, 1973) having been incorporated into the Licensing (Scotland) Act 1976. Included within these reforms were the introduction of extended opening hours and the permission of all day opening. This has not been the case in all countries, however. The international literature review noted, for example, that some countries have attempted to restrict the hours during which the sale of alcohol is permitted (with Italy, Germany and Portugal, for example, imposing such restrictions during the 1990s).

2.18 In terms of the impact of measures to regulate licensing hours, the cost-effectiveness study reported that some studies (from other countries):

“have suggested that longer licensing hours increase alcohol related problems”.

2.19 The international literature review also notes that, although having little effect on total consumption, some studies suggest a link between licensing hours and problems. In addition, Edwards et al (1994) pointed to evidence from other countries which suggested that longer hours during which alcohol could be sold had led to increased problems. Conversely, it has been suggested that shorter hours can lead to a reduction in these problems.

2.20 Raistrick et al (1999) cite studies by Olsson and Wikstrom (1982), and Nordlund (1985), which suggest that there is a direct link between licensing hours and problems. They concluded that:

“this suggests that in some circumstances variations in hours can have a direct impact on alcohol problems”.

2.21 Although some have suggested that the 24 hour sale of alcohol may reduce alcohol-related harm, the international literature review noted that there is evidence from, for example, Australia, to suggest that 24-hour licensing can increase local alcohol-related harm and adverse effects. For example, the review noted that:

“past increases in hours of alcohol sales in Michigan, Perth, New South Wales, Victoria, Tasmania, Brisbane, Finland and Sweden have been shown to result in increases in road deaths and injuries and/or violence”.

2.22 Smith (1989) also commented specifically upon the results of Australian studies which examined changes to days and hours of sale of alcoholic beverages. He noted that, following the introduction of Sunday alcohol sales in Perth, there was a 64% increase in the number of people killed on Sundays. In Brisbane, where an 11.00 a.m. Sunday session was introduced, the number of property damage incidents between noon and 1.59 p.m. increased by 53%. There was also an annual increase of 85% in property damage accidents for the two hour period after a 4.00pm – 6.00pm session. Smith also reported evidence of increases in casualty accidents following the extension of hours of sale of alcoholic beverages.

2.23 Many of the UK studies have focused on the impact of licensing hours upon a range of alcohol-related problems, rather than specifically upon crime and disorder. The evaluation of the licensing changes in Scotland carried out by the Office of Population Censuses and Surveys (1986), for example, did not identify the impact of the changes on actual harm. Clayson (1984) however, compared Scotland to England and Wales, and found a relative decline in alcohol-related violent crime, drunk driving and drunkenness, although the methodology of the study was challenged (Saunders, 1985), with the suggestion that factors other than the licensing changes may have affected these outcomes.

2.24 A report in 1992 for the Portman Group (Marsh and Fox Kibby, 1992) suggested that:

“the Scottish material is neutral with regard to the impact of the various changes to permitted hours. While some areas have

experienced increased problems, others have seen a decline in drink-related disorder”.

The cost-effectiveness study also concluded that UK evidence in relation to the effect of relaxing licensing hours in general remains mixed.

Closing times

2.25 In relation to the linked, but more specific issue of closing times, Hope (1986) identified a clustering of violent incidents around closing time. Suggestions followed relating to the potential impact of staggered closing times, although Raistrick et al (1999) note that this:

“may simply disaggregate the problem”.

They go on to note, however, that:

“even this might be an advantage from a policing point of view, if it improves the ability of law enforcement authorities to manage outbreaks of disorder”.

2.26 A Home Office document¹⁹ suggests that staggered closing times can create:

“a more relaxed drinking culture, by avoiding the perceived necessity to binge drink in advance of closing time, and to avoid the potential problems that can arise when a number of licensed premises send all their patrons onto the streets at the same time”.

Deehan²⁰ (1999) noted that this could reduce the number of people on the streets at the same time, often seeking food and transport. Marsh and Fox Kibby (1992) also suggested that less restrictive licensing hours can lead to a decline in the rate of drinking, and people leaving licensed premises in smaller groups.

2.27 Raistrick et al (1999) also noted that:

“there is some evidence to suggest that if selectively applied and carefully managed, such a strategy might have an impact on alcohol related disorder.”

A study in Manchester (Lovatt, 1996) found a fall in city centre arrests and a decline in alcohol related incidents during an experimental period of staggered closing times.

2.28 Although there is a generally positive view of this measure in the literature, Raistrick et al (1999) nevertheless stress the importance of taking account of local

¹⁹ “Tackling Alcohol Related Crime, Disorder and Nuisance” (2000) London HMSO

²⁰ As with Raistrick et al (op cit) this review contains many examples of studies, some of which are referred to here. Again, they are not always individually highlighted as being identified in Deehan’s study, but the importance of that work overall in providing this material is acknowledged here.

circumstances when considering staggered closing times, as well as being aware of the likely impact of later closing times on the surrounding community.

Curfews

2.29 There have also been some experiments with the use of curfews, and a report prepared for the Portman Group report “Keeping the Peace” (St.John-Brookes, 1998) noted that an experiment was undertaken in Glasgow in 1993, where people were not allowed to enter or re-enter clubs after midnight. It was found that, by January 1994, there had been an overall reduction in some types of violence and disorder in the city centre area, and the report stated that:

“the police concluded that the curfew had had a significant impact on the maintenance of order on the city’s streets”.

2.30 The report noted that these benefits were maintained with the extension of the curfew in 1995 until 1am. (This issue is also explored in relation to local initiatives, and the hours have been extended further.)

Legal drinking age

2.31 There has also been some debate about whether or not there is a need to change the age at which young people are allowed to buy and drink alcohol on licensed premises. Views have been found to range from those who suggest that a reduction in age would address some of the problems of young people drinking in unsafe locations, to those who consider that there is a need to raise the age to a point where young people would be more aware of the dangers of alcohol misuse.

2.32 In terms of recent practice, the international literature review noted that, between 1994/95 and 1999, three European countries without an age limit introduced a higher age limit for buying alcohol, while two lowered this (Bulgaria and Ukraine). Some countries have different age limits for on and off sales, and some for different types of alcohol.

2.33 In terms of the impact of initiatives which have been tried elsewhere, the international literature review noted that some studies suggest that lowering age limits reduces the potential for drinking in unsafe and unsupervised places.

2.34 Evidence from Australia, however, suggests that there was a rise in male juvenile crime following the lowering of the drinking age to 18 in some states (Smith and Burvill, 1987). In addition, Smith (1989) cited two evaluation studies in 1987 which suggested that lowering the drinking age may affect juvenile crime, with the finding that in Queensland, South Australia and Tasmania, legislative changes to lower the drinking age increased male juvenile crime by 20-30%. Smith also noted that limited data for Western Australia provided similar results. A number of offence categories were found to be likely to be significantly increased and these included burglary, larceny of motor vehicles and drunkenness. He concluded, therefore, that:

“it does not seem unreasonable to suggest that raising the drinking age should lead to a reduction in male juvenile crime”.

2.35 In terms of driving, specifically, the cost-effectiveness study noted that there is evidence from the US to suggest that:

“raising the legal drinking age to 21 has reduced alcohol related crashes and injuries”.

2.36 Many US studies suggest significant reductions in crashes and fatalities, with a drop in alcohol related traffic deaths of 10-15% amongst young people. Martin (2001) notes that raising the minimum legal drinking age to 21 in the United States has not only reduced drinking and driving, but has

“probably reduced youth homicide rates as well”.

2.37 The cost-effectiveness study also noted, however, that there remains a general lack of work in this area, with problems in measurement due to the levels of underage drinking.

Outlet density

2.38 The number and density of licensed premises may affect the sale of alcohol either through competition or through easing the purchase of alcohol. It has also been suggested that the granting of too many licenses in an area can affect the standards of such premises and can lead to competition in the form of some types of promotion which have been identified as causing concern. Raistrick et al (1999), for example, noted that there are potential knock on effects of the number of outlets on alcohol-related problems (such as reduced costs and promotions, and tolerance of activities such as drunkenness and under-age buying as premises compete for business.)

2.39 For these reasons, some have suggested the need to limit the availability and consumption of alcohol through control or restriction on the number of licenses of different types which are granted and control of “outlet density”.

2.40 The evidence for the Plan for Action found differing views of the need for control of the number and types of license. There was evidence of some concern about the proliferation of licenses, new pubs, theme bars and “superpubs”. It has also been suggested (for example, by some respondents to the consultation) that there should be consideration of the number of licensed premises in an area (perhaps in relation to the size of the population) before a license is granted.

2.41 In terms of evidence of the impact of outlet density upon alcohol related harm, the international literature review suggested that the weight of evidence points to a link between the number of outlets and problem levels, and that limitation may have an effect on alleviating problems. There is some evidence from the US (Gruenwald et al, 1993; Watts and Rabow, 1983) and from Finland (Osterberg, 1982) to suggest that

there is a positive association between the number of outlets selling alcohol and overall consumption. In relation to crime and disorder specifically, Scribner et al (1995) suggested a link between the density of outlets and violence. A study in Norway (Norstrom, 2000) also suggested that increases in the number of public drinking places was associated with increases in criminal violence.

2.42 Martin (2001) suggested that studies focusing on alcohol availability have found that outlet density appears to have:

“negative consequences on communities at a neighbourhood level”.

She reports data from Los Angeles County which has indicated that the rate of assaults was significantly associated with density of on and off-sale outlets, where a 1% increase in density was associated with a 0.62% increase in the rate of violent offences. She also reported a study in Newark which found that alcohol outlet densities were significantly related to the violent crime rate. Limited evidence from evaluation also suggests that lowering outlet density in “hotspots” will reduce alcohol-related offences.

2.43 The cost-effectiveness study suggested that UK evidence in relation to outlet density is mixed, although Raistrick et al (1999) state that:

“a concentration of outlets within a small area is often linked with disorder”.

Types of outlet

2.44 It has also been suggested that the type of outlet may be an important factor in consideration of alcohol problems. The international literature review noted that Denmark, Latvia, Luxembourg, Portugal and Spain have placed new restrictions on the place of sale of alcohol during the 1990s. (During the same period, however, a number of other countries have removed some restrictions.)

2.45 In terms of the impact of outlet types, Wolfson et al (1996) suggested that, in the US, there are variations in how different types of outlet observe under age drinking laws. The cost-effectiveness study noted that US evidence suggested that:

“grocery stores were more prepared to sell to minors than other types of outlet. Factors associated with lower sales to minors included being part of a chain, membership of a trade association and having a high proportion of income from alcohol sales”.

2.46 Raistrick et al (1999) also suggested that there is evidence that nightclubs and bars involve a higher level of risk of assault than restaurants or social clubs (Stockwell, 1992). Such factors have led to suggestions that there could be some control of the availability of alcohol through different types of outlet (e.g. supermarkets, grocers, petrol stations), although again views of this were mixed in the consultation findings.

Advertising controls, pricing and taxation

2.47 As noted earlier, these issues are outwith the remit of Scottish legislation, and are considered only briefly here. However, they should also be noted in the context of controls which can be imposed upon the sale of alcohol.

Advertising

2.48 The evidence for the Plan for Action noted that, in the UK, there are currently voluntary controls on alcohol advertising and marketing through the Advertising Standards Authority (ASA) and Independent Television Commission (ITC). The Portman Group also has a voluntary code.

2.49 Despite these controls, however, it is often suggested that there is a need for further control of alcohol advertising, and many responses to the written consultation, for example, suggested that regulation is not always effective. The types of controls which were suggested included, for example:

- Statutory controls
- An independent regulator
- A watershed for alcohol advertising
- A ban on (or more control of) advertising / sponsorship in sport

2.50 The international literature review reported that the Nordic countries have complete bans on alcohol advertising, although it is noted that France also has a ban on TV advertising and restrictions on other media. The review also noted that a number of countries have legal restrictions on all, or almost all, media in terms of alcohol advertising. Only 5 out of 39 countries in a study by Rehn et al (2001) require health warnings on advertisements, and the review suggested that research evidence relating to the impact and effectiveness of this approach is not well-developed. A total of 9 out of 27 countries in the same study (Rehn et al, 2001) had regulations affecting sponsorship of young people's leisure activities.

2.51 The main focus of studies on these issues has been upon the impact of bans on alcohol advertising, and such studies have found *some* effects of bans upon *some* aspects of consumption (although not necessarily linked directly to crime and disorder). The cost-effectiveness report noted, however, that it may be more likely that countries which already have a low level of consumption will ban alcohol advertising. The alcohol producers' submission to a SACAM expert seminar also pointed to evidence from Sweden which showed that alcohol consumption had remained steady following a ban on advertising.

2.52 Overall, in terms of advertising, the cost-effectiveness study concluded that:

“studies of advertising and alcohol consumption over time have failed to find a significant association”.

For young people, however, there was a:

“small but significant association between exposure to and awareness of advertising and drinking beliefs and behaviours”

Pricing / Taxation

2.53 Raistrick et al (1999) have suggested that changes to pricing have an impact on the level of alcohol consumption. In terms of taxation, the cost-effectiveness study noted that:

“there is good and consistent evidence that fiscal policy (taxation) is effective in reducing total alcohol consumption, although estimates of the size of the effect are variable ... evidence suggests that the alcohol consumption of the heaviest 10% of drinkers is not responsive to price increases but problem drinkers below this level do respond. The evidence relating to under-age and youth drinking is unclear.”

2.54 The international literature review also noted that research demonstrates that, when other variables are unchanged, a decrease in alcohol price leads to an increase in consumption. It has also been recognised, however, that the “costs” of increasing prices fall upon all of those who use alcohol and upon the alcohol industry.

2.55 There remain gaps in information about the effect of pricing on sub groups such as young people. This was raised by Raistrick et al (1999) and was reiterated in the cost-effectiveness study, which noted that:

“the evidence relating to under-age and youth drinking is unclear”.

Edwards et al (1994) also noted the importance of other influences upon alcohol consumption and the need to consider economic measures in their overall context.

2.56 Again, it should be borne in mind that these studies did not comment specifically on the impact of these initiatives upon alcohol-related crime and disorder, but upon the level of consumption of alcohol. Given the perceived links between the level of consumption and crime and disorder, however, this material is clearly relevant to the consideration of these issues.

2.57 One paper was identified (Markowitz, 2000) which did examine the specific relationship between the price of alcoholic beverages and the actual incidence of criminal violence, using data from around 50,000 respondents in 16 countries. Markowitz concluded that, where the data could be considered reliable, the results indicated that higher prices for alcoholic beverages led to lower incidents of all three types of violent crime explored (robbery, assault and sexual assault).

2.58 Generally, however, there was a lack of evidence in relation to the direct impact of pricing upon alcohol-related crime and disorder.

REGULATION OF CONSUMPTION, INITIATIVES FOR SPECIFIC GROUPS OR CRIMES AND ENFORCEMENT OF EXISTING LAW

2.59 The second type of initiatives identified included those which have aimed either to regulate the availability and consumption of alcohol to address issues for particular groups, to tackle specific crimes or forms of behaviour, or to enforce the existing law in a particular geographical area.

2.60 The evidence report for the Plan for Action highlighted a focus on the need for such law enforcement, and there is evidence of developments in other jurisdictions of new initiatives which have targeted specific crimes and behaviour.

Targeting groups or areas

2.61 Some initiatives relating to regulation and control have focused upon enforcement initiatives which target the availability of alcohol to specific groups or within geographical areas. This often involves a period of intensive input, involving law enforcement and high profile policing.

2.62 There has, for example, been a growing concern over alcohol consumption by young people (which was reflected in the evidence for the Plan for Action), and this has been the focus of a number of initiatives. Deehan (1999) noted that the peak age for arrest for drunkenness (at that time) was 18 and suggested that drunkenness was not uncommon amongst young people, with links to criminal activity and public nuisance.

2.63 There are also concerns with other patterns of drinking and with the identification of “hotspots” where there may be particular problems. Initiatives to address these issues have taken a number of forms.

Police operations

2.64 High profile policing in an area is seen to be one means of targeting a range of issues, including underage drinking. Jeffs and Saunders (1983) found that high profile policing and enforcement of the law relating to underage drinking was linked to a decrease in the rates of crime and the number of arrests. In that study, uniformed police visited all licensed premises in pairs, 2-3 times per week, and checked for drunk and under age patrons. A reduction in public order offences of 20% was reported.

2.65 Grube et al (1997) pointed to work in California which found that, in experimental sites where there were interventions relating to the enforcement of underage sales laws, responsible server training and media advocacy, sales to apparent minors were “significantly reduced”. These interventions involved increased enforcement by police (including the use of warning letters and decoy operations), training to off sales outlets, with the development of effective store policies, and the development of community support through the use of the local media.

2.66 Willner et al (2000), also carried out a study using pairs of 13 and 16 year old boys and girls attempting to purchase different types of alcohol before and after a police intervention to address underage drinking (involving warning letters and visits to vendors). They found, however, that there was no evidence to suggest that the police intervention reduced sales to 16 year olds, with only a short lasting decrease for 13 year old girls (and an overall increase in sales to this age group). They also found that only two vendors believed that there would be adverse consequences for them if they sold alcohol to minors.

2.67 There have also been initiatives in some English cities where police forces have gathered evidence, through undercover methods, to identify retailers which were breaking the law (e.g. through test purchasing). There is little evaluation material available relating to the success to this work, although one of the responses to the written consultation suggested that:

“following the introduction of test purchasing in England and Wales, a brief comparison was made of the total number of criminal proceedings taken against shopkeepers for such an offence for the twelve months prior to the introduction of test purchasing and the twelve months after it. The results demonstrated that the policy shift had no material effect in reducing the problem”.

2.68 Although no reference was provided for these findings, not all studies of intensive policing have reported positive results in reducing crime. Also, there is currently little systematic evidence available in relation to other experimental work by police forces.

2.69 More generally, in terms of targeting other groups or outlets, Raistrick et al (1999) suggested that there is some “circumstantial evidence” to suggest that some outlets are harder to police than others (with off-licenses and clubs cited as examples). The cost-effectiveness study identified that Raistrick et al (1999) noted that general high profile policing around licensed premises is associated with a reduction in crime rates.

2.70 Purser (1997) reported on an experiment to tackle under age drinking and other problems in the Coventry city centre area which involved enforcement of local licensing laws, increased visits from magistrates and other developments. It was identified that, although there was no ongoing data collection, crime and fear of crime appeared to have been reduced. Deehan (1999) also noted the findings of a “Torbay Enforcement Study” where the police visited pubs and clubs, as well as running an arrest project which involved asking those arrested where they had been drinking. The study found a reduction in recorded crime of 16%, with a particularly high reduction in alcohol-related crime.

Community enforcement programmes

2.71 Raistrick et al (1999) suggested that the community has a vital role in addressing alcohol problems, and can have a role in controlling availability of alcohol.

In the UK, some areas in England have established multi-agency groups to help to enforce the law. Little evaluation evidence from these initiatives could, however, be identified.

2.72 The cost-effectiveness study reported that there is some limited US evidence to support community enforcement programmes. It was noted that an initiative was undertaken (“Communities Mobilizing for Change on Alcohol”) where communities developed their own initiatives to address under age drinking. A number of different activities were carried out in different communities, including restrictions on sales. It was found that, over two years later, the likelihood of alcohol sales to minors was lower, and that there were more frequent checks made of alcohol outlets.

2.73 Hauritz et al (1998) looked at community-based safety action projects designed to reduce violence and disorder in licensed premises, in city entertainment areas, in three areas in Australia. These projects involved monitoring and persuasion through the local community, and self-regulation by licensees. The study found that there was a decline of 56% in all aggressive and violent incidents. There was also a decline of at least 75% in physical assaults (although they noted that it was impossible to draw conclusions about direct causality).

2.74 Other work also supports this approach, and Hauritz et al (1998) pointed to work in Victoria where a code of practice for self-regulation, combined with entry and exit controls to prevent pub-hopping, had been linked to a reduction in serious assault rates. Similarly, they noted that the evaluation of the “Surfers Paradise Safety Action Project” in 1993 showed a clear initial impact of the project and a reduction in “practices that promote the irresponsible use of alcohol”. There was also a decline in observed verbal abuse (by 82%), in arguments (by 68%) and physical assaults (by 52%). Street incidents also showed a general decline. Police statistics also showed a decline in assaults, indecent acts, stealing, and drunk and disorderly incidents. The need to continue to ensure compliance with the Code in the longer term was, however, also noted.

2.75 Stockwell (2001) also reported the development of “alcohol accords” during the 1990s in Australia, involving partnership working to create a safer environment. Codes of practice were drawn up and signed by licensees (for example, to limit high risk promotional and sales practices). Training was also provided, and a halving of violent incidents was reported within the first six months (although this was not sustained over a two year period). Stockwell, however, concluded that voluntary regulation was not sufficient without more formal changes to regulation and law.

2.76 Treno and Holder (1997) in the United States reported on a five year project involving community mobilisation and responsible serving, as well as limitations on access to alcohol. Amongst other findings, they noted a reduction in underage sales and in alcohol-involved traffic crashes.

2.77 Lewis et al (1996) evaluated the effects of a community-based substance misuse coalition’s efforts to reduce the sale of alcohol and tobacco products to minors. Adults and minors visited supermarkets, convenience stores and liquor stores, and issued “citations” and “commendations” depending on whether stores agreed or

refused to sell. They found a marked decrease (83% to 33%) in sales to minors in those stores where there was “citizens’ surveillance”.

Proof of age

2.78 The Portman Group has had a Proof of Age scheme since 1990, through which people over the age of 18 can get identity cards (although the use of this is not comprehensive), and there are also local schemes. The evidence which underpinned the Plan for Action identified support for a national proof of age scheme, and Raistrick et al (1999) suggested that this could assist law enforcement by making it easier for licensees to identify ages of potential customers. The Portman Group report “Keeping the Peace” (1998) also noted that schemes can have a deterrent effect and assist licensees.

Intoxicated drinkers / server laws

2.79 Although it is an offence to serve someone who is drunk, it has been suggested that this rarely results in prosecution. It has been suggested, however, that the enforcement of the law in this area can also help to reduce alcohol related crime and disorder. The Home Office recognised this in their Action Plan²¹, stating that:

“responsible serving practices are critical to the effort to reduce alcohol-related crime [and] disorder”.

2.80 A pilot scheme in Michigan was undertaken to enforce the laws relating to serving alcohol, by forbidding serving intoxicated drinkers. A cost-benefit analysis was carried out by Levy and Miller (1995) and reported in the cost-effectiveness study. Data relating to “fatal and non-fatal injuries as a consequence of drinking” were collected before and after the programme, and cost savings identified.

Information gathering and dissemination

2.81 A further element of law enforcement is the collection and dissemination of information relating to perpetrators of alcohol-related crime and disorder. This includes both the development of specific schemes and more general surveillance.

Pubwatch / clubwatch / shopwatch schemes

2.82 Information sharing schemes (often known as “Pubwatch”, “Clubwatch” and “Shopwatch” schemes), which keep troublemakers out of pubs, clubs and shops, have been developed in many areas. These generally involve shared information to reduce access to licensed premises by people who are drunk or who are known to be “troublemakers”. People who cause trouble may be banned from “watch” premises and their movement between premises monitored.

²¹ op cit (2000)

2.83 The Portman Group report “Keeping the Peace” (1998) suggested that these usually involve a communications network between licensees and police to provide warnings of potential trouble, with the suggestion that these can deter troublemakers and provide a drinking environment which is safer. The report suggested that the benefits to licensees are the reduction in risk of property damage and staff assaults (and, consequently, enhanced trade), while the benefits to the police are the reduction of disorder and the more effective deployment of their resources. In terms of the effectiveness of such provision, the Home Office (2000) suggested that:

“these schemes provide an effective measure for keeping troublemakers from licensed premises”.

2.84 Deehan (1999) also noted that a Pubwatch scheme in Sheffield reported a fall in alcohol-related crime in its first year. The Portman Group report “Keeping the Peace” (St. John-Brookes, 1998) gave the example of an initiative undertaken through the formation of Bradford Inner City Licensees’ Association, which involved banning people from all of the member premises and displaying “lists of shame” (alongside other work involving proof of age and staff training). It was suggested that there had been a decline in alcohol-related disorder of 80%. An example of work in York was also given, where all on-licenses were required to join a Pubwatch scheme as a condition of an on-license (along with other conditions, such as door registration). All of the work undertaken was seen to have had a significant role in reducing crime and disorder in the city, which was reported to have declined by 40% between 1993 –and 1997 (although details of types of crime were not provided).

2.85 The same report noted that an initiative called “Shop a Shop” was undertaken as part of the Strathclyde Police “Spotlight” initiative, which involved reporting unscrupulous traders. Police officers reported an apparent reduction in the number of young people with alcohol, as well as traders becoming more circumspect in their sales.

Identifying premises

2.86 The provision of information, has, in some cases, extended to the identification of licensed premises where trouble has taken place.

2.87 A project in Canada (reported by Deehan) involved asking everyone arrested for drink driving where they had had their last drink, and passing the names of the bars to the Licensing Board. This was linked to the provision of warnings (and potential suspension). In its early stages, there had been reductions in the number of arrests near to the named bars.

2.88 An example was identified (in Cardiff) of the publication of a league table of pubs and clubs where violent incidents had occurred (Shepherd, 1999). People attending the local Accident and Emergency Department were asked whether they had been drinking and where an assault had taken place, and a table was compiled, with figures being provided to the local newspaper every two months as well as being passed to the police. Shepherd concluded that:

“the test of the work of the CVPG is, of course, the impact on assaults. The number of people injured in assaults seen at the A and E department has fallen year on year since a peak of 3600 in 1993/4. Likewise, the venue at the top of the assaults league table ... has seen fewer assaults every month since the table was introduced”.

CCTV

2.89 It is outwith the remit of this report to review the effectiveness of CCTV in general, and there is considerable literature relating to this. It should be noted, however, that many towns have now developed CCTV, and it has been suggested that this can also have a deterrent effect in relation to alcohol-related crime and disorder, although it is better when used alongside other measures, such as Pubwatch schemes (e.g. St. John-Brookes, 1998”).

2.90 The Portman Group report “Keeping the Peace” (St. John-Brookes, 1998) provides examples of successes in Ipswich and Burnley of the use of CCTV, with Burnley highlighted as using CCTV as part of an overall strategy to tackle alcohol-related disorder. CCTV was used along with Pubwatch, a registration scheme and work with young people, and it was noted that crime in the town centre (other than shoplifting) dropped by 48% between April 1995 and February 1996.

Exclusion orders

2.91 The same Portman Group report noted that exclusion orders can be used to prohibit people from entering licensed premises where they have been found guilty of violence or threatened violence on licensed premises. Although that report found the use of such a measure low in Scotland (with the availability of other measures to refuse service), it was suggested that a number of English locations had found this to be a useful tool in addressing disorder.

Controls on location of drinking

2.92 There have also been some initiatives undertaken to control the location of drinking. The international literature review noted that various parts of the world have policies which prohibit alcohol consumption in particular places. Sewel (2001) suggested that in North America this is often public places, with a recent focus on recreational locations (e.g. parks and beaches), at workplaces and in cars. The review pointed to work by Rehn et al (2001) which found that, in 1994/95, in 60% of the countries they studied, there was legislation to provide alcohol-free environments in some settings, rising to 85% in recent years.

Sporting events

2.93 Raistrick et al (1999) noted that the availability of alcohol at, or on the way to, sporting events is controlled in legislation. Sewel (2001) also highlighted recent attempts to control alcohol availability at some sporting events, but noted that research has identified difficulties with these measures, relating to the level of revenue generated for the events through the sale of alcohol. Nonetheless, there have been attempts to control alcohol consumption at sporting events, and the study concludes that:

“there is as yet no controlled evaluation of the effects of restrictions on alcohol-involved events at public locations, or on the impact on the subsequent drinking and driving by participants”.

Drinking outwith licensed premises

2.94 Raistrick et al (1999) noted that drinking in public has been the focus of considerable attention in recent years. Internationally, an Australian study (Tuncks, 1999) was identified which examined the use of dry areas to control consumption / possession of alcohol in public places. The study found that, in one area which had become a “drinking place”, this had now stopped and it had become used as a tourist area. There had also been a decrease in assaults and other offences in city streets. In another area, the number of people who were apprehended for public drunkenness had dropped.

2.95 In the US, Hoffman (1998) reported that a ban in alcohol consumption in Washington DC parks on the 4th of July 1997 had been termed a success, with both police and park officials claiming a reduction in “serious incidents, arrests and trash”. Serious assaults during the 1996 and 1997 celebrations dropped from 11 to 0, arrests from 40 to 7, and the clean up time was halved.

2.96 In the UK, some local authorities have byelaws which prohibit drinking in public places, again regulating the consumption of alcohol and the number of locations with such byelaws has grown steadily.

2.97 In “Keeping the Peace” (St. John-Brookes, 1998) the use of byelaws was considered in detail. The report noted that, in 1988, 7 English local authorities undertook a two year experiment to explore the effectiveness of a byelaw, which made it an offence to drink alcohol in designated areas after receiving a police warning. An evaluation of the experience in Coventry suggested that the use of such measures should be extended. Ramsay (1989) explored perceptions in Coventry city centre prior to the introduction of the experimental byelaw which made it illegal to consume alcohol in public except on licensed premises. The research suggested that the byelaw may assist in addressing fear of crime in the area, and a follow up study (Ramsay, 1990) found that, although police statistics suggested that assaults, robberies / thefts from the person and criminal damage seemed to be unaffected by the byelaw, there was:

“a modest but undeniable reduction in fear... likewise there was a drop in incivilities – specifically in insults by strangers”.

2.98 There was also a drop in the proportion of people who saw unruly groups of young people, and people drinking in public, as common problems. The study found that enforcement was not particularly taxing for police officers, and concluded that:

“the reduction in drink-related insulting by strangers does suggest that the general atmosphere in central Coventry had changed for the better. The byelaw could well have contributed to this improvement”.

2.99 Police officers also endorsed the byelaw and almost two thirds of those interviewed stated that it had had a positive effect on the general level of disorder, if not “crime proper”. The police also noted that they would have found additional powers beneficial, such as seizure and arrest. It was also suggested that:

“A more widely popular innovation in social control would be hard to imagine”.

2.100 Positive results were also suggested in Glasgow, with the Portman Group report (St. John-Brookes, 1998) noting that the “Spotlight” initiative (launched by Strathclyde Police in 1996) involved (as part of its work) the enforcement of a byelaw prohibiting public consumption of alcohol in the city. It was suggested that previous problems which had been prevalent in one area had almost gone, and there was seen to have been a general reduction in disorderly behaviour. The same report also gave the example of the use of a byelaw in Argyll and Bute to prohibit drinking in designated areas and to reduce the level of alcohol-related disorder at the Cowal Highland Gathering.

2.101 In addition, Ramsay (1989) suggested that initiatives which involved the prevention of drinking in the street were generally considered successful in reducing the fear of alcohol-related crime and disorder. It has also been noted, however, that this depends on effective law enforcement and may cause problems for other areas, by moving the location of problems. This issue was raised in The Portman Group study (St. John-Brookes, 1998), where it was also noted that the operation of the byelaw was enhanced where it was part of wider work to tackle alcohol-related disorder. Raistrick et al (1999) reported, however, that:

“local authorities and the police seem satisfied with the experience so far, as reflected in the rapid take-up rate”.

Drink Driving

2.102 The final issue which should be considered amongst initiatives aimed at law enforcement or targeted work is the consumption of alcohol by drivers, which, as Raistrick et al (1999) noted, is regulated by Road Traffic Acts.

2.103 Drink driving has been the focus of a number of specific initiatives in the UK and elsewhere. The international literature review noted a number of types of initiative which have been used in attempts to tackle drink driving, suggesting that this has been a key area in which controls have been developed and implemented.

2.104 In the USA, legislation and enforcement have been used in a number of ways to try to reduce drink driving, with, for example:

- An overall reduction in permissible blood alcohol levels
- Lower blood alcohol levels for young people and for people with previous convictions for drunk driving
- Random breath testing
- The use of specific sanctions such as ignition interlock devices and mandatory license suspension

2.105 The cost-effectiveness study identified that the actions taken have been generally successful. Edwards *et al* (1994) also suggested that drink driving measures can be effective where these are enforced vigorously and where there is a high public profile for these measures.

Reducing Permissible Blood Alcohol Level

2.106 The international literature review pointed out that the EU has adopted a programme of priority measures for road safety, including a recommendation to ratify blood alcohol limits of 0.5% or less. The report suggests that, while many European countries are in line with this (e.g. Austria, Belgium, Denmark, Finland, France, Germany, Greece, Netherlands, Portugal and Spain), the UK limit is higher at 0.8%. Sewel (2001) points out that many countries have reduced their limits in the past five years. Some countries have lower limits for young drivers or professional drivers.

2.107 The cost-effectiveness study noted that evidence from the US suggests that reducing the permitted blood alcohol level for driving to that of the UK for all drivers has been found to be effective in reducing the number of crashes and the number of fatalities.

2.108 For young drivers, there has been a 20% decline in crashes likely to involve alcohol. One study reported in the cost-effectiveness report suggested that the effect may increase as the level of alcohol which is permitted is reduced. In one US state, evidence suggested a positive effect of the introduction of a lower level of permitted alcohol for drivers who have a previous drink driving conviction.

Random breath testing / checks

2.109 The international literature review pointed to some evidence of an increase in recent years in the number of countries having random breath testing, and in the frequency of use of this method.

2.110 The cost-effectiveness study suggested that the best evidence of effectiveness in relation to enforcement of legislation is that which relates to random breath testing, with evidence from both the USA and Australia of the effectiveness of this. For example, it was noted that:

“all studies except one showed reductions in fatalities, injuries and crashes and the exception could also be reanalysed to show a decrease.”

2.111 US evidence relating to a “community sobriety checkpoint” (identified by Miller et al, 1998, and reported in the cost-effectiveness study) was also reported to have benefits which exceeded the costs. The international literature review further noted that:

“studies have repeatedly concluded that if there is a high likelihood that a drinking driver will be caught and that if caught the punishment is severe and quickly applied, then the drinker is more likely to avoid drink driving.”

Mandatory License Suspension and Ignition Interlock

2.112 The international literature review noted that some countries have implemented mandatory and immediate license suspension.

2.113 The cost-effectiveness study suggested that the evidence relating to the effectiveness of mandatory license suspension (where this is immediate upon failing a test) is mixed (McArthur and Kraus, 1999), but it has reduced crashes and fatalities in some (although not all) of the states studied. The international literature review also noted evidence of a general deterrent effect.

2.114 It has been suggested, however (Sewel, 2001), that studies have shown low levels of compliance with some sanctions (for example where suspended drivers continue to drive). Nevertheless, some studies have concluded that sanctions combined with treatment can be useful in addressing issues relating to some “hardcore” drinking drivers.

2.115 It is also suggested (Cobin and Larkin, 1999) that findings indicate that ignition interlock devices can be effective in preventing drivers re-offending. With these devices, a driver must provide a sample of breath before starting the engine, and if that sample indicates a level of alcohol above that which is permissible, the ignition is locked and the vehicle immobilised. The international literature review noted that there are again compliance issues around the measure, with, for example, drivers continuing to drive in other people’s vehicles. Again, however, it has been suggested in some studies that these measures, combined with others, have the potential for a longer term effect. The cost-effectiveness study suggested that these measures may not translate directly to the Scottish situation.

Other work

2.116 Finally, it should be noted here that legislative changes to address these issues often overlap (as in other aspects of tackling alcohol problems) with preventive work and provision of services. Other forms of work in this area include, for example, the

development of designated driver schemes. Such schemes generally involve encouraging groups in participating restaurants and bars to identify one member of the group to be the non-drinking designated driver. The establishment then provides the designated driver with complementary non-alcoholic drinks. There is, however, currently little evaluative evidence relating to these schemes. Additionally, other work includes campaigns and awareness-raising, and referral to alcohol education programmes, as well as counselling for drink driving offenders.

Alcohol as a defence

2.117 Finally, in this category, it has been noted that some defendants use alcohol as a means of “excusing” violent behaviour. Parnanen (1998) noted the importance of recognising that drunkenness should not excuse crime and disorder, and should not lead to a milder sentence. It is suggested that:

“publicizing the fact that drunkenness is an extenuating circumstance only under rare circumstances, if at all, may prevent some alcohol-related violence”.

INITIATIVES RELATING TO THE ENVIRONMENT / CONTEXT OF ALCOHOL CONSUMPTION

2.118 In the third overall category, it has been suggested that changes to the physical environment in which alcohol is consumed can have a specific impact upon crime and disorder. In a submission to the SACAM expert seminar²², Dr Betsy Thom suggested that:

“anti-social behaviour and offending (especially related to alcohol and aggression) may be exacerbated in particular drinking environments (e.g. noisy, overcrowded, poor/aggressive door and server approaches, availability of cheap / free drinks, tolerance of intoxication / aggression”.

2.119 The Home Office (Deehan, 1999) also suggested that research has shown that the following contribute to alcohol-related aggression:

- Overcrowding
- Poor bar layout / inconvenient access
- A permissive environment which fails to tackle anti-social behaviour
- Bar workers who fail to practice responsible serving
- Inappropriate promotions that encourage heavy / binge drinking

2.120 Martin (2001) noted that research suggests that bars with a reputation for violence are more likely to experience this, as are those which are unclean, poorly

²²Thom, B. “Young Men, Alcohol and Crime” in MacAskill, S., Cooke, E. and Hastings, G. : “Prevention of Alcohol Misuse : Informing the Strategy” Report Supplement

ventilated, dimly lit and patronised mostly by groups of males. It has also been identified that violence is more likely where there is unrestricted swearing, sexual activity, drug use / dealing and crowding. It has also been found to be more likely where there are low staff to patron ratios and a lack of sensible serving practices.

2.121 There has been an increase in the development of initiatives to address alcohol-related crime and disorder through schemes which address the management of the drinking environment and the physical environment itself. The international literature review, for example, noted that:

“international experience demonstrates that recent attempts to prevent and reduce the harm associated with excessive alcohol consumption have shifted focus from the individual to the setting in which drinking takes place”.

Managing the Environment

2.122 Initiatives to address the management of the environment have often focused on the provision of training to those who are involved in the sale of alcohol or the management of outlets.

Server training

2.123 Raistrick et al (1999) suggested that there was “considerable variation” in the quality of management and supervision of outlets. The Home Office (2000) noted that there is evidence that aggression is associated with bars where:

“the staff have little or no control, where they do not engage in responsible serving practices, where they allow a permissive environment (drug use, swearing, sexual activity) large crowds and high volume noise levels.

2.124 The perceived need for training for those involved in the sale of alcohol was stressed in the evidence for the Plan for Action, and has focused particularly on training for licensees, serving staff and door stewards. It has been suggested that well-trained staff can have a positive impact on discouraging excessive drinking and that only those who have received training should be granted licenses. The evidence report for the Plan for Action suggested that training might include issues such as:

- Server interventions
- Serving those intoxicated
- Proof of age
- Legal responsibilities
- Management of violence
- Environmental issues
- Effects of alcohol
- Harm caused by alcohol

2.125 The Portman Group report “Keeping the Peace” (St. John-Brookes, 1998) suggested that:

“training is the best way of equipping licensees and their staff to anticipate, prevent and, if necessary, deal with alcohol-related violence”.

2.126 The international literature review noted that responsible beverage server programmes have been popular in the US and Australia, and in Europe (particularly in the Netherlands). Server interventions are identified as having a direct role in addressing crime and disorder, with four purposes identified (Sewel, 2001) as being to reduce:

- Intoxication in on-site alcohol outlets
- Alcohol sales to minors
- Intoxicated driving
- Alcohol related injury and violence

2.127 A study by Holder and Wagenaar (1994) found that server training can reduce alcohol problems, especially under age drinking. The cost-effectiveness study identified work from the USA which pointed to benefits of a server training programme exceeding its costs. Buka and Birdthistle (1999) also identified positive results with trained servers.

2.128 The international literature review suggested that such programmes can be effective, for example, in reducing the harmful consequences of drink driving. Holder and Wagenaar (1994) evaluated a state-wide mandated training for servers in Oregon, and found statistically significant reductions in single vehicle night time crashes (those with a high percentage of alcohol involvement). Holder and Wagenaar also cited a range of studies which suggested that server training, along with changes in policies, can lower the risk of alcohol-related harm.

2.129 Hauritz et al (1998) suggested that server programmes are valuable if combined with enforcement, but there need to be other measures as well. Simons-Morton and Cummings (1997) found that a training course for servers led to “significant improvements” in participants’ perceptions of their role in preventing drunk driving. Stockwell (2001) suggested that server interventions works well when there is strong back up from management, but pointed out that this is not always the case, and suggested that:

“disincentives to serve alcohol to drunk and under age customers can be created which are more effective than exhorting staff and managers to serve alcohol responsibly”.

2.130 Stockwell pointed to the need for a law enforcement approach, with penalties for licensees breaking the law, rather than relying upon server training alone. Other studies have also suggested that there is a need for a long term, continuing programme of enforcement and compliance with the requirements, with the effectiveness, for

example, of mandatory programmes dependent on the enforcement of these and continuing compliance.

Server liability

2.131 Alongside server training, some have also suggested the introduction of “server liability” where those providing alcohol are held responsible for the consequences of inappropriate practices. This has been common in the US and Canada, where it has included specific statute law (which aids claims under negligence provisions) and has been applied to bar owners, employers, producers and hosts. Several countries were also identified in the international literature review in which there are sanctions or penalties for those who serve alcohol in an irresponsible way.

2.132 The written consultation noted that it had been suggested that these measures could be developed in Scotland, accompanied by guidelines and penalties, and stricter monitoring. Ireland (1995) suggested that, in the US and Canada, damages awarded to those suffering injury / damage have been considerable. He concluded that:

“the stimulus of liability under Dram Shop legislation or extended common law negligence has been a very powerful engine for change in North America and has driven introduction of training programs such as alcohol serving and management programs”.

Door registration schemes

2.133 It is also argued that door staff can prevent aggressive behaviour or can minimise the impact of this through the actions they take (and that they can increase this through inappropriate responses). St. John-Brookes (1998) noted that the first door staff registration schemes in England and Wales were in the early 1980s, increasing in the 1990s. Although the report noted that Scottish law does not allow registration schemes, there is scope to impose a condition of staff training on granting regular extensions to licensing hours.

2.134 Glasgow City Council was cited as an example of an authority which, in 1994, provided Guidelines for the Management and Control of Licensed Premises which recommended that those in premises providing entertainment should receive training. Marsh and Fox Kibby (1992) found that door staff could have a central role in reducing violence (supported in evidence by Wells et al, 1998). St John-Brookes (1998), however, called for a national scheme of registration for door staff.

Self-regulation

2.135 In addition to formal regulations affecting staff, Raistrick et al (1999) also noted that less formal controls, such as the licensed trade’s own rules and regulations, can also have an impact and that:

“taken together, these self-regulatory activities have the potential to reinforce the effectiveness of legal regulation to a considerable extent by promoting a consistent approach to availability at the local level, and by improving the enforcement of existing laws”.

2.136 Generally, the international literature review concluded that:

“research indicates that achieving effective responsible alcohol service requires:

- the public be made aware of the issue;*
- intense enforcement of alcohol control laws;*
- strong policies on and commitments to responsible beverage services on the part of owners and managers;*
- training programs for servers”.*

It is suggested in the literature that server initiatives tend to be most effective when used to enforce legislative provision, rather than as stand-alone measures.

Point of sale information / health warnings

2.137 The development of educational point of sale information and unit labelling have been suggested as a further means of addressing alcohol problems. The evidence for the Plan for Action identified some views suggesting that health warnings should be printed on alcohol containers (with the suggestion that this could be extended to other forms of advertising material). It was also suggested that compulsory notices could be displayed in licensed premises about health dangers.

2.138 The international literature review suggested that many US states require or promote signage at the point of purchase, with research demonstrating that these reach most customers, although there is a lack of systematic research relating to their effectiveness as a preventive measure.

2.139 The review also noted that a number of countries (outwith Europe) have “mandated health warning labels on alcohol containers”. These include, for example, Brazil, Columbia, Costa Rica, Ecuador, Honduras, Mexico, South Korea, the US and Zimbabwe. The review suggested, however, that these measures alone are unlikely to have a “significant impact” on drinking behaviour and, while they may raise awareness, there is no consensus in the research of their effects.

The Physical Environment

2.140 In addition to the management of the environment, it has also been suggested that the actual physical environment (i.e. the context in which drinking takes place)

can have an impact upon alcohol consumption and its perceived consequences. St. John-Brookes (1998) suggested that:

“good design of licensed premises can make a significant contribution to reducing the likelihood of disorder or criminal activities”.

A number of ways of addressing the physical environment have been suggested (and, in some cases, tried).

Attractive outlets

2.141 A number of specific suggestions have been made about the need for development of outlets which are generally more attractive, and Graham et al (1980) for example, found that there was a significant correlation between aggression and premises which were poorly maintained.

2.142 A review of alcohol and crime carried out by Deehan²³ for the Home Office found that attractive and well-maintained licensed premises had fewer violent incidents. Suggestions to make premises more attractive have included, for example, the encouragement of food consumption within licensed premises, and the development of more “family friendly” environments. Deehan (1999) suggested that serving food was associated with fewer incidents of aggression (Graham et al, 1980).

2.143 St. John-Brookes (1998) provided an example of changing the appearance of a pub, citing the “Pear Tree” in Greater Manchester which had a history of violence and eventually closed. After a total redesign, it reopened as a “model of a community local”.

Layout

2.144 Research has identified specific issues relating to the layout of licensed premises, and Pernanen (1991) found that lack of seating and inaccessible bars can affect movement and can contribute to aggressive behaviour. Crowding has also been identified as affecting this. In addition to developing generally attractive premises with trained and capable staff, avoiding promotions and inappropriate sales, staggering closing times and serving food, Deehan (1999) suggested that the following elements of good practice relating to layout were identified in research as means which may lessen public order problems on licensed premises:

- Raised bar area, good seating
- Good ventilation and control of numbers
- Expectation of socially acceptable behaviour

2.145 The Portman Group report (St. John-Brookes, 1998) discussed these issues in more detail, suggesting the need to consider the following:

²³ “Alcohol and Crime : Taking Stock” (1999) HMSO

- **Frustration**, which can arise through insufficient serving areas, poor layout, uncomfortable sound, heating, lighting and machines being sited in appropriate places
- **Layout**, with “contagion” of aggression. A need for open plan space divided off in order to separate customers, but which allows monitoring, is suggested
- **Flow patterns**, with a need for customers to be able to move around with minimum physical contact with others, reducing the opportunity for spillage, jostling and conflict
- **Siting and design of the bar**, with a need for staff to have control of their own space, entrances and exits and to have clear sight to the toilets. The report notes that a raised bar can make the environment safer by making it easier to see customers
- **Lighting**, with a need to avoid extremes

All of these considerations, it is suggested, can have an impact on the premises’ experiences of disorder.

Promotion of alcohol

2.146 The ways in which licensed premises promote alcohol consumption has also been raised as an area of concern. Many respondents to the written consultation suggested that “happy hours”, drinking games and other similar marketing strategies were inappropriate.

2.147 The Portman Group report (St. John-Brookes, 1998) suggested that:

“the practice of serving alcohol at discounted prices for a limited amount of time can encourage immoderate consumption of alcohol and lead to public order problems if not employed with caution”.

The evidence for the Plan for Action also identified a concern with these issues, which, it was suggested, can encourage heavy drinking and binge drinking. This concern received support in the finding by Homel and Clarke (1994) that promotions could increase consumption of alcohol and aggression.

2.148 Concern over the inappropriate promotion of alcohol has led to the suggestion of the need for controls on any “promotional binge drinking” and upon these means of selling alcohol. This issue has also been raised in England and Wales, where the All-Party Group on Alcohol Misuse suggested that promotions should be taken into account when considering renewals of licenses.

Materials

2.149 The evidence report for the Plan for Action noted some suggestions relating to the control of the materials used for drinking alcohol, including that toughened glass

should be used. Research has shown that beer glasses are a commonly used weapon in assaults, making them on occasion a cause of permanent disfigurement (e.g., Shepherd et al, 1990).

2.150 The Home Office Action Plan (2000) noted that toughened glasses are six times more resistant to impact and that, when they shatter, it is into blunt, rather than sharp pieces. Deehan (1999) noted that evidence suggests that the mandatory use of toughened glass would lessen the likelihood of severe facial injuries. St. John-Brookes (1998) noted that work in Torbay in 1993, where toughened glass was a requirement for premises with public entertainment licenses or special hours certificates, suggested that the number of glassing attacks had dropped.

2.151 It has also been suggested that there should be restrictions on bottle purchase in licensed premises. Raistrick et al (1999) noted that some local authorities in England were considering the development of byelaws relating to the drinking environment, such as banning drinking from bottles in pubs and nightclubs. It was also suggested in the written consultation exercise that litter laws could be strengthened to increase the penalty for broken glass hazards.

2.152 St. John-Brookes (1998) suggested that:

“whatever policies are implemented with regard to use of toughened glass and sale of bottled drinks, licensees can substantially reduce the risk of glassing attacks on their premises by ensuring that empty bottles and glasses are regularly collected”.

Other measures

2.153 Finally, although not relating directly to control of the environment, it is also important to note that work has also been undertaken to develop the provision of late night transport in some areas (for example, assisted taxi booking, late buses etc.).

OVERVIEW

2.154 All of the work which has been outlined in this literature review is relevant to the debate about the regulation and control of alcohol in Scotland. The implications of these findings are discussed briefly in the final chapter of the report.

2.155 The following chapter presents the findings of the survey of initiatives of these types which are currently taking place (or have recently taken place) in Scotland, along with participants’ perceptions of their effectiveness.

CHAPTER 3: AUDIT OF CURRENT INITIATIVES IN SCOTLAND

3.1 Having explored the literature, the focus of this part of the work was upon the identification of current and recent initiatives in Scotland, which have involved the regulation or control of the sale of alcohol or the context of consumption. In order to link the findings, the initiatives which have been identified through this audit have been grouped into the same overall categories as those identified in the literature review.

3.2 The first part of this chapter provides a summary of the respondents to the research by type and geographical area. Details of the actual initiatives are then provided, grouped by the categories identified, and giving more detailed examples where appropriate.

3.3 It should be stressed that the purpose of this part of the report is to provide a largely qualitative account of work being undertaken in Scotland. Although the numbers of initiatives of each type are given, the general focus is upon identifying patterns and examples of these, and specific numbers are not provided of the more detailed examples. There are a number of reasons for this. A simple count of initiatives would provide a misleading account of the scale of some of the work and an underestimate of the extent of coverage of such initiatives. In many cases, one initiative which was identified may involve in practice, for example, the regulation of all licensees in the area covered by a police force area or Licensing Board, thus involving a large geographical area and a large number of licensees. Although this means that the actual number of initiatives in Scotland is likely to be higher than the reported number, this does not materially affect this study, as the focus is upon the lessons which can be learned.

3.4 In addition, given variations in the scale of initiatives, information is not comparable between them. Such qualitative detail is, in any event, unnecessary, as the purpose of this report is to highlight examples of practice and perceptions of their effectiveness. It is also inappropriate to suggest that this is a comprehensive account of all initiatives in Scotland focusing on the regulation and control of alcohol (as the study relied upon organisations identifying their own and others' work). The value of the data, however, is in the identification of the types of organisations which are carrying out initiatives, the types of work which are being undertaken and the perceptions of those involved in these initiatives, particularly in terms of "what works" and any ways in which the initiatives could be improved.

RESPONDENTS

3.5 A total of 219 completed pro forma were returned, providing details of a range of current and recent work in Scotland. Some organisations were involved in more than one type of initiative and submitted a number of pro forma. This was particularly the case for the police where, for example, one force may be involved in a variety of initiatives in one location, or in separate initiatives in different locations. More details of these initiatives are provided later in this chapter.

Types of organisation reporting initiatives

3.6 The sources of pro forma by type of organisation are detailed in the following table.

Table 1. Sources of pro forma by type of organisation

Respondent type	Number	% total
Police and criminal justice	108	49
Drug/alcohol specialist teams/organisations	31	14
Licensing Boards	29	13
Local authorities	22	10
Voluntary organisations (general)	11	5
Partnerships ²⁴	9	4
Health	5	2
Alcohol industry and business organisations	2	1
Other	2	1
Total	219	100

A total of 13 of these forms were multiple references to the same initiative (e.g. sent by two separate organisations which were involved) and these were removed, leaving details of a total of 206 initiatives. The remainder of the analysis relates to these forms.

3.7 It should be noted here, however, that many of the individual initiatives may have had an impact across a large geographical area and may have included many individuals and businesses. Also, given the focus of the work upon regulation and control, it was not surprising to note that “police and criminal justice organisations” (most of which were police forces) provided the source of almost half of the returns.

3.8 In addition to the pro forma evidence, a discussion was held with a representative who provided a response on behalf of the Association of Chief Police Officers in Scotland, which gave an indication of the range of work being undertaken by the police. It was noted that this type of police work takes place at a number of levels, e.g., with the police represented at a strategic / policy level on the Scottish Advisory Committee on Alcohol Misuse (SACAM), information sharing and discussion between police forces, force level initiatives, and work taking place in parts of a force area. As well as multi-agency work through SACAM, police officers are also involved in inter-agency working at a local level through a range of groups and partnerships.

3.9 It was suggested that the police have a clear understanding of the links between alcohol and crime and a shared view of the types of initiatives required in order to address this. During the discussion, the importance of the police working in partnership with other organisations was stressed, and there was considerable evidence of this provided.

²⁴ This includes, for example, Community Safety Partnerships and Social Inclusion Partnerships

3.10 Only one example was found amongst the pro forma responses of a police officer who was less positive about the level of work being undertaken in their particular area, and who stated that:

“to sum up, police involvement in specific alcohol related partnership initiatives in [area] = none. Regular patrols on known underage drinkers’ haunts is about as much as we do”.

This was, however, clearly an exception amongst the police respondents, with most forces providing many examples of work being carried out.

3.11 It was also noted in the discussion with the ACPOS representative that the work of the police in relation to regulation and control takes place in an overall context, which includes a range of parallel work being undertaken by other organisations, such as preventive / awareness raising work and service provision. Licensing Boards are also a key organisation involved in regulation and control, and it is clear from the table that many provided information about initiatives taking place in their areas.

3.12 Local authorities and specialist drug and alcohol teams/services were also represented, although the focus upon regulation and control should be borne in mind, as it is likely that much of the work of these and health organisations will relate to preventive work and service provision. They were, however, involved in partnership or collaborative working in some cases.

3.13 A discussion was also held with a representative from The Scottish Local Authorities Community Safety Forum (SLACSF), as this type of work is relevant to much of their activity. It was stressed that this Forum and local Community Safety Partnerships (of which, it was pointed out, there are 32 in Scotland) bring together a number of organisations (e.g. police, local authorities and others) which have a key role in addressing alcohol problems. It was also suggested that the structure of these partnerships provides an appropriate means of tackling a multi-faceted issue.

3.14 Much of the focus of the work of the Forum and Partnerships is upon education / awareness raising and service provision to people with alcohol problems. It was also suggested, however, in relation to the specific focus of this report, that Partnerships have a role in initiatives relating to regulation and control of alcohol. In particular, they have a role in relation to providing a forum for the discussion of local and national needs/emergent issues and “what works”. There is also a key role in information sharing, with individual organisations which are represented on the partnerships carrying out work and reporting back to the main Forum.

3.15 It was stressed, in discussion, that there is a need for all of these forms of work to be linked together, with initiatives which focus upon legislation, regulation and law enforcement considered alongside awareness raising / education and service provision. It was suggested that appropriate legislation should underpin the work of other types being carried out, supporting the overall objectives and approach of reducing alcohol problems, with the different types of initiative forming parts of a coherent strategy.

3.16 It was also noted in the pro forma responses from individual partnerships that tackling alcohol related crime and disorder runs through many of the strategic goals and actions of Community Safety Partnership work. The discussion with SLACSF identified that most of the partnerships are considering issues relating to tackling alcohol problems. One suggested, for example, that this was linked, amongst other initiatives, to work to address vandalism, road safety, domestic abuse, racist incidents, drugs and alcohol.

3.17 Generally, there were few forms returned by alcohol industry and business organisations, although the importance of their involvement in some of the initiatives has been recognised in the development of the Plan for Action. A meeting was held, however, with a representative of the Scottish Beer and Pubs Association (SBPA; previously the BLRA Scotland), who indicated that a range of work continues to be carried out through the alcohol industry and business organisations. Details of this were provided during the discussion.

3.18 As was the case with the police, the importance of working in partnership was stressed, and it was found that work takes place at a number of levels in the industry. The SBPA is involved in a number of government bodies and has input to a range of consultations. The Association is also involved in the work of the Portman Group, which carries out a variety of relevant work. The SBPA also works through its members as owners of pubs, with members encouraged to participate in work which is taking place. Members at a local level engage with other organisations, including the police, with whom many positive relationships have been established.

3.19 Where additional information was provided in these discussions, or was provided by organisations by letter without completing a pro forma, the details have been added to the findings from the pro forma survey and are also discussed in the following sections, as the presentation of the findings focuses on qualitative detail.

3.20 It is worth noting here that many of the organisations, which were unable to identify initiatives that were being undertaken, responded to indicate that alcohol-related crime was an area of interest and concern to them. Some also noted that it was likely that work to address these issues might be undertaken in the future.

3.21 Given the central role of the police in initiatives relating to regulation and control, the initiatives identified were grouped into the police force areas from which they were reported (see Table 2).

Table 2. : Reported initiatives by police force area

Area	Number	% total
Lothian and Borders	54	26
Strathclyde	48	23
Grampian	23	11
Tayside	21	10
Fife	19	9
Northern	14	7
Dumfries and Galloway	6	3
Central Scotland	3	1
National	18	9
Total	206	100

3.22 As would be expected in accordance with their size, the highest proportion of initiatives were identified in the Lothian and Borders, and Strathclyde force areas. It is worth noting at this point, however, that the response from Central Scotland Police aggregated a range of initiatives on a single form relating to the “Safer Central” initiative. Therefore, although a pro forma may have reported one overall “initiative”, there was a broad range of work taking place. This again demonstrates the importance of focusing upon the details of the work rather than a count of actual instances of initiatives. It is likely that one form was used to describe multiple types of work in other areas (most notably “Spotlight” campaigns in Strathclyde, but potentially elsewhere).

Types of initiative

3.23 The initiatives were organised into the three broad areas identified in the literature review:

- Initiatives to control availability of alcohol through licensing (including, for example, the imposition of conditions upon licenses, work to address opening hours or other aspects of sale of alcohol)
- Regulation of consumption, initiatives to tackle specific groups or crimes and enforcement of existing law (including, for example, drinking in certain locations, under age drinking, drink driving, etc)²⁵
- Regulation or control of the environment or context of alcohol consumption (including, for example, staff training and registration, the use of toughened glass, design changes etc.)

3.24 In addition to these areas, although the focus of the audit was on initiatives relating to regulation/control of alcohol and the drinking environment, many respondents reported other types of work which was aimed specifically at reducing

²⁵ It is recognised that 1 and 2 are similar, and both involve regulation and control of the availability of alcohol, but the focus in the second category is more specifically upon law enforcement and regulation for particular groups or types of crime.

alcohol related crime and disorder. These have been noted separately in Table 3. Such work often accompanied the initiatives of the type described.

3.25 The numbers of initiatives which related (at least in part) to each of these overall areas was found to be as follows:

Table 3. Initiatives by type²⁶

Type	Number	% total
Initiatives to control availability of alcohol	26	13
Regulation of consumption, specific groups & enforcement	107	52
Environment / context of alcohol consumption	57	28
Other	87	42

3.26 A number of initiatives had multiple goals which included a combination of these type, sometimes with additional goals such as education and preventive work, or provision of services. A total of 40 (19%) of the initiatives could be considered to have multiple goals (e.g. controlling availability of sale and consumption of alcohol along with regulation of consumption for particular groups; initiatives targeting specific groups along with training initiatives or improvements to the drinking environment etc.).

3.27 Respondents were also asked to identify the types of behaviour which the work sought to target, and indicated as follows:

Table 4. Type of behaviour targeted²⁷

Behaviour	Number	% total
Under age drinking	117	59
Violence and aggression	113	57
Binge drinking and drunkenness	103	52
Availability of alcohol	64	32
Noise	60	30
Other specific behaviour	56	28
Environmental damage	52	26
Drinking and driving	41	21
Other	43	22

3.28 It is clear from Table 4 that the three aspects of alcohol-related crime and disorder at which the highest proportion of initiatives were directed were under age drinking, violence and aggression and binge drinking and drunkenness. These are areas which have been identified as being of concern in Scotland in other evidence and, as will become clear, the types of work carried out reflected this focus.

²⁶ Many initiatives involved actions of more than one type

²⁷ Many of the initiatives targeted more than one type of behaviour.

3.29 Overall, in terms of factors which were seen to contribute to the overall success of initiatives, the following emerged repeatedly:

- The importance of partnership / multi-agency working
- The need for individual initiatives to be undertaken as part of a wider strategy to address alcohol problems
- The need for resources

Within this overall context, the responses were analysed further in each of the overall categories and the findings are presented below.

INITIATIVES TO CONTROL LICENSING / AVAILABILITY OF ALCOHOL

3.30 Measures to control licensing and availability of alcohol were described in the literature review as including initiatives such as:

- Licensing regulation
- Licensing hours
- Closing times
- Legal drinking age
- Outlet density
- Types of outlet
- Advertising and pricing

3.31 When the work identified in Scotland was examined, a total of 26 initiatives were found which could be seen to fall into this category (13% of the total initiatives). Clearly, part of the reason for this relatively low number of examples of formal controls on licensing and availability of alcohol is that some of these issues would require statutory regulation at a national (or UK) level, and are thus less likely to be found being developed in local areas. In addition, however, as many of these initiatives were reported by Licensing Boards, although the number of individual initiatives is smaller than in other categories many of these applied across wide areas of Scotland, and to large numbers of licensed premises.

3.32 The initiatives which were reported in this category were largely those which could be regulated by the local Licensing Boards, and the commonest were the imposition of conditions upon licensing (often linked to the regular extension of permitted hours) and the development of policy documents. These initiatives were often linked to other related work to address behaviour by specific groups or environmental changes which were being carried out in the area, and will be described in due course).

3.33 The types of work being undertaken through these initiatives, which are relevant here, have been summarised in Table 5.

Table 5. Types of work

Type of work	Number	% total of this type
Work with licensees	14	54
Work relating to licensing hours	13	50
Staff training ²⁸	10	38
Intelligence / information gathering	6	23
Controls on number / volume of off sales	5	19
Work with retailers	4	15
Controls on number / volume of on sales	1	4

3.34 At a local level, there is no opportunity to regulate sale and consumption through overall opening hours (as these are established in law), legal drinking age, types of outlet or advertising and pricing, so many of the types of action identified in the literature review were not found in the survey. Table 5, however, identifies the main focus of initiatives in this category, with most of this involving work with licensees and the regulation of licensing hours or the imposition of conditions and controls upon licensees through the existing licensing process.

3.35 Respondents provided some examples of the ways in which the need for these initiatives had been identified. This often involved a generally increased public awareness of alcohol-related disorder, or a specific increase in complaints. In one case, for example, it was identified that there had been complaints of an increase in assaults, alleged to have been perpetrated by untrained door stewards.

The target behaviours

3.36 The initiatives in this category identified a range of behaviour which would be addressed by the work, with the majority focusing generally upon addressing violence and aggression or binge drinking and drunkenness, but also often including other forms of behaviour (see Table 6).

Table 6. Target behaviours

Behaviour	Number	% total
Violence and aggression	17	65
Other specific behaviour	12	46
Binge drinking and drunkenness	11	42
Under age drinking	9	35
Availability of alcohol	9	35
Noise	8	31
Environmental damage	5	19
Drinking and driving	3	12
Other	3	12
Not answered	1	4

²⁸ It should be noted that this refers only to staff training which is linked specifically to formal regulation and controls. More general provision of staff training is described later in this section.

Examples of ‘other’ behaviours included specifically homophobic crime, drug misuse and poor door stewarding practice.

Specific examples of initiatives

The imposition of conditions – staff training

3.37 As noted above, the most common type of work which was identified in the Scottish survey (in terms of initiatives to control licensing) was the imposition of conditions upon the granting of licenses. This affected both extension of hours and outlet density.

3.38 The nature of the conditions varied, but these were often related to the requirement for licensee, staff or door steward training (both through byelaws and through regular extension of permitted hours conditions) and, in some cases, door steward registration. Staff training is discussed further later in relation to regulation of the drinking environment but, in these cases, was linked directly to the regulation and control of the actual opening hours and thus to the overall availability of alcohol. A number of Licensing Boards reported the development of such requirements in recent years.

3.39 Examples of this included one Licensing Board, which noted by letter that they were introducing a policy early in 2002 under which any regular extension of permitted hours to a registered club would be conditional upon at least one member or employee completing and obtaining a training certificate within the duration of the extension. Another identified that they had introduced a local scheme to address the regulation and suitability of door stewards in the absence of any statutory provision for this. One Board identified that it has its own training scheme which door stewards were required to attend, while others did not specify the source of the training.

The Imposition of Conditions – Radio link and CCTV

3.40 The conditions identified did not only relate to training, however, and a further example was identified (through the interviews) of a Licensing Board applying a condition that town centre premises join a radio link scheme which worked in conjunction with a CCTV system. One Licensing Board also noted that nightclubs across their area must have a minimum number of cameras as a condition of the regular extension of permitted hours.

The imposition of conditions – drinking up times and curfews

3.41 Two further conditions identified related to drinking up times and curfews (to control the movement of people between pubs and nightclubs).

3.42 One example was provided (by letter) of a Licensing Board policy relating to drinking up times, where entertainment licensees could obtain a regular extension of permitted hours each day up to 3.00am, but a condition was attached to each extension, stipulating that the sale of alcohol should stop at 2.45am to allow a thirty minute drinking up period.

3.43 Two other examples were found of initiatives which related to closing times and the development of effective “curfews”. In both cases, the curfew was imposed as a condition of the regular extension of permitted hours, through the enforcement of a “no-admittance” rule after a designated time depending on the agreed closing time of the venue. In one of these cases, it was noted that the relevant local authority had worked in conjunction with the Licensing Board to restrict the hours of catering establishments and street traders to reflect the overall objectives underpinning the restrictions to extensions of permitted hours.

3.44 One Licensing Board also noted by letter that they had formulated a set of “policy hours” to regulate late night / early morning closing times for premises in the area. The respondent noted that:

“in formulating these policy hours, the Board has sought to strike a balance between the rights of licensees to run their businesses, the rights of customers to enjoy reasonable drinking hours and the rights of neighbouring proprietors to the peaceful enjoyment of their property”.

The imposition of conditions – other

3.45 A number of Licensing Boards were also identified as imposing conditions on licensees in relation to the use of toughened glass. An example was also identified of the specification of the need for clearance of empty glasses and bottles. It was suggested that this had reduced the likelihood of serious injury where glassware was used in an assault. In addition, one respondent noted by letter that non-glass drinking vessels must be available on request for children.

3.46 Conditions specifying the number of patrons and the level of lighting were also identified by one Board. Two Licensing Boards noted by letter that when children’s certificates were granted, amongst the conditions were that there would be no “happy hour” or similar promotions in operation during the hours when the children’s certificate was in force.

Outlet density

3.47 No specific examples were given of controls upon the number of off or on-sales premises, but many responses indicated that this was included in the work undertaken. In the cases where this was mentioned, Licensing Boards indicated that they took account of the existing number of outlets (i.e. outlet density) as a factor in reaching their decisions.

3.48 In addition to the examples provided on the pro forma, one Licensing Board also sent an example of a leaflet entitled “How to Object to a Liquor Licensing Application”, which provided details for objectors on how to object to licensing applications. This clearly affects the regulation and control of alcohol sale and consumption and, indirectly, outlet density.

Type of outlet

3.49 In terms of controls on the types of outlet selling alcohol, one Licensing Board noted that they had declined to grant new licenses to sites selling petrol, as they considered that this would provide an inappropriate message to drivers. Another Licensing Board noted that they had been concerned about the sale of “alcopops” (sweet fruit flavoured alcoholic drinks) and would also consider, in the renewal of off-sales licenses, the internal layout of the outlet.

The development of policy / guidelines

3.50 Finally, in this category, a number of Licensing Boards indicated that they had developed specific local policies and guidelines on various aspects of licensing to formalise some of the conditions outlined (often in relation to permitted extensions to opening hours of licensed premises, but also in relation to other issues).

3.51 A number of respondents described the development and implementation of policy documents relating to regular extensions. One example of this was a policy whereby where pubs in a city centre could open from 11pm to midnight on each night, and those outwith the city centre could do so on Friday and Saturday only. For entertainment venues, the extensions were until 3am in the city centre and 2am outwith this area.

3.52 An example was also provided of a policy having been developed in response to increasing complaints from local residents and businesses, where an effective ban was placed on regular extensions outwith the weekend period. These changes were accompanied by a Licensing Board review and the issue of guidelines.

3.53 One Licensing Board provided an example of new guidelines having been developed following a public consultation exercise, while another provided details of guidelines which had developed for dance events (with related conditions attached to entertainment licenses). One police force also reported the development of guidelines for the administration of police warnings to licensees and the provision of warning letters.

3.54 These policy documents often included details of the conditions which would be applied to licenses. Many policies provided details of staff training requirements, including examples of the need for refresher training, while others specified, for example, materials to be used in licensed premises and other conditions of licenses which have been identified in this report. It should be noted here that many Boards had a number of policy documents and one, for example, provided a range of policy

documents relating to many of the above issues. All of these initiatives are likely to have an impact upon the overall regulation of sale and consumption of alcohol.

Perceptions of success

3.55 In terms of perceptions of the success of this type of work, 15 of the 26 responses in this category (58%) suggested that the work that they had carried out had been successful. It should be stressed, however, that there were only two cases in which the work was considered unsuccessful, with the remainder either having been introduced too recently to indicate success or where the respondent was unable to determine the outcome fully.

3.56 Although there was little formal evaluation evidence of the success or otherwise of these initiatives, some police responses provided information in relation to general trends. Many additional positive comments were also made and other anecdotal evidence also provided about these initiatives. Some of the more specific comments are noted below.

Imposition of conditions

3.57 Initiatives of this type were perceived to have been successful overall and, within this, there were seen to be benefits in the imposition of conditions on licenses.

3.58 Staff training conditions were generally viewed as a positive development, with door steward registration schemes also highlighted as useful. One Licensing Board, for example, reported that a scheme which was based upon registration, vetting and training had been welcomed by most of the traders in the area.

3.59 One issue raised in relation to the imposition of conditions was that a number of respondents expressed some frustration with the current approach to the training and registration of door stewards, particularly the lack of formalised “vetting” procedures and agreed standards, making it necessary to develop local schemes linked (in these cases) to licensing conditions. This issue is discussed further later in the report.

3.60 In relation to the use of curfews, one police respondent suggested that the use of these had helped to reduce the incidence of street disorder. It was also suggested that curfews had been successful in another area, where a review, for example, had identified that:

“it was the view of the police that the controls introduced by the Board in relation to evening extended hours had an effect on the movement of persons both within and from the city centre and in turn this had had a positive impact on policing both in relation to the best use of available police resources and the incidence of crime and disorder generally”.

3.61 A general point made by one Licensing Board in relation to the use of byelaws was that there was a need for:

“a more receptive and responsive approach to the introduction of model byelaws under the 1976 Act for the better management of licensed premises”.

In this case, the Board suggested that they had been seeking central government approval of model byelaws for a number of years.

Policy / guidelines

3.62 Similarly, the development of policies on regular extensions and the use of local guidelines were seen to be generally successful. One Licensing Board noted, for example, that reports from the Chief Constable had provided evidence of the impact of the development of a policy on regular extensions, and a high level of public support for this had also been identified. Another respondent suggested that figures presented to the Licensing Board showed a correlation between an increase in late licenses and an increase in street disorder (evidenced in the number of calls to the police) thus indicating the value of limitations to regular extensions.

3.63 In terms of guidelines, one of the Licensing Boards noted more specifically (for example) that:

“evidence from [the] police demonstrated that the number of incidents of street disorder reduced following the introduction of the guidelines”.

It was also suggested that the process of developing guidelines had impacted upon public awareness of the issues and raised the visibility of alcohol-related disorder.

Unsuccessful initiatives

3.64 In the 2 cases (8%) where initiatives of this type were not considered successful, this related to a perceived lack of resources in one case, and to the fact that the initiative had tried to cover too many issues in too short a period of time in the other. In the first case, it had been hoped to attempt to use pricing during the festive period as a means of promoting responsible driving habits by encouraging the consumption of soft drinks. Although the respondent identified that the project had been established and partners gathered, nothing further could be achieved due to the cost of implementation. In the second case, the work had involved not only attempts to control the number of off-sales, but had also comprised a range of other types of work concurrently and was unable to achieve its goals due to the volume of work required.

General perceptions

3.65 A number of points were made in relation to less tangible benefits of initiatives in this category, such as improvements in the relationship between the police and licensees, and the existence of what was described as a “high level of public support”.

3.66 There was a strong emphasis in responses relating to control of availability of alcohol on joint working between licensing authorities, police and licensees, in order to enforce these conditions in a co-operative climate. This was seen to be a key factor in the success of this type of work. One police force, however, identified that control of sale and consumption of alcohol through the use of measures by Licensing Boards could cause some policy and operational difficulties for them, where one force had to respond to the different demands of a number of Licensing Boards. Generally, however, the use of such controls by Licensing Boards was seen to make a positive contribution to the reduction of alcohol-related crime and disorder.

REGULATION OF CONSUMPTION, INITIATIVES FOR SPECIFIC GROUPS OR CRIMES, AND ENFORCEMENT OF EXISTING LAW

3.67 The largest number of initiatives identified in the audit related to regulating consumption for specific groups, measures to tackle specific crimes or the enforcement of the existing law. These measures overlap, to some extent, with the more general controls described in the first category, with these forms of regulation and control being undertaken within the existing legal framework, impacting upon the availability and consumption of alcohol. Examples of law enforcement / targeting initiatives were identified in the literature review as including:

- Targeting groups or geographical areas (e.g. intensive police operations or “clampdowns”, underage drinking and proof of age, intoxicated drinkers)
- Information gathering and dissemination (e.g. Pubwatch)
- Controls on locations of drinking (e.g. sporting events and the use of byelaws to prohibit street drinking)
- Drink driving

3.68 A total of 107 examples of initiatives were identified which undertook this type of work, comprising more than half (52%) of all of the initiatives undertaken. It was found that the initiatives described were largely consistent with the types of work which were identified in the literature review. Many of the initiatives involved a number of different types of work and rarely focused upon only one means of regulation. It is useful, therefore, to summarise the range of forms of work in this category as follows²⁹:

²⁹ It should be borne in mind that one “initiative” might comprise several strands.

Table 7. Types of work

Type of work	Number	% total of this type
Targeting groups / areas	88	82
Information gathering and dissemination	68	64
Controls on location	14	13
Drink driving	12	11

3.69 Table 7 identifies the main focus of the work in this category as being that which targets specific groups or geographical areas, alongside considerable work relating to improving information-gathering and dissemination.

3.70 As was the case in the initiatives described in the first category, much of this work was also combined with staff training, and this is discussed in more detail later in relation to initiatives focusing upon changes to the drinking environment.

Target behaviours

3.71 As was the case in the first group initiatives, the initiatives in this category identified a range of types of behaviour which would be addressed by the work (see Table 8).

Table 8. Target behaviours

Behaviour	Number	% total
Under age drinking	70	67
Violence and aggression	65	62
Binge drinking and drunkenness	46	44
Noise	39	37
Availability of alcohol	36	34
Environmental damage	27	26
Other	23	22
Other specific behaviour	22	21
Drinking and driving	20	19
Not answered	2	2

3.72 It is clear that many of the initiatives aimed to address a range of issues relating to crime and disorder which were seen to involve alcohol. Although there was a clear focus upon using regulation and control to tackle under-age drinking, there was also found to be a general focus on addressing violence and aggression (as well as many other aims, such as targeting binge drinking, environmental damage etc.). The most common target for initiatives which were identified as “other” was drinking in public, although a small number identified that the misuse of other drugs was also a target.

3.73 The reasons for the development of these initiatives were wide ranging, and included:

- Expressed public concern
- The development of, or need for, joint working between license holders and the police
- Local implementation of national initiatives (e.g. proof of age, drink driving)
- The development of strategies and work by local partnerships such as Community Safety Partnerships and Social Inclusion Partnerships
- Police monitoring of crime patterns and other intelligence

This provides a general indication of the types of initiative which were identified in this category.

Specific examples

3.74 More specific examples are given below of some of the ways in which work of all of these types was found to be carried out.

Targeting groups or geographical areas

3.75 As noted in Table 7, a total of 88 initiatives were found to involve targeting groups or geographical areas. Generally (in around 80% of cases) these initiatives involved intensive policing / law enforcement or a local “clampdown” on specific behaviour/activities. This might include, for example, high visibility policing, and enforcement of byelaws. (It should be noted, however, that the police mentioned that routine police visits were also carried out to licensed premises.)

3.76 Some of the targeted initiatives comprised addressing alcohol-related crime as part of a wider law enforcement programme (such as Spotlight on Safer Streets or the Safer Scotland Violence Campaign). Others had some aspect of alcohol-related crime as their main or only focus. Where alcohol was part of a wider programme, the Spotlight work, for example, involved targeting street drinking, under age drinking and weapon carrying.

3.77 The Safer Scotland Violence Campaign involved all Scottish Police Forces, the British Transport Police and the Procurator Fiscal Service in targeting resources at problematic premises (in terms of serious crimes of violence). This was a nationally co-ordinated campaign part of which involved tackling alcohol-related crime. The largest number of examples, however, involved specific intensive policing aimed at some form of alcohol related crime or a “clampdown” on such crime, introduced in association with other, more specific measures (such as the introduction of a Pubwatch scheme or a targeted campaign relating to under age drinking).

3.78 One specific example of intensive policing was provided by a police respondent who noted that, on a single day, over 10,000 visits had been made to licensed premises. A further example was provided by a Licensing Board, which, in conjunction with the police, had developed information to licensees about targeted offences, coupled with a programme of visits to premises by police officers to provide advice and guidance.

3.79 Some “clampdowns” were associated with identified targets and, in terms of focusing upon groups, by far the most common was young people. A total of 54 initiatives were identified as carrying out specific work relating to alcohol purchase and use by young people, of which 37 involved an element of “clampdown”. This is consistent with the identification of young people as a group for whom there is specific concern. Examples of this work included a number of initiatives which involved high profile policing of the implementation of the law relating to under age drinking, through, for example, police patrols and surveillance of off and / or on-licenses.

3.80 A number of examples were identified of the specific use of stop and search powers as a means of identifying young people who were carrying alcohol. One force indicated that, as well as high visibility patrols utilising stop and search powers, plain clothes officers were also deployed, from time to time, to identify where alcohol was being carried by young people. As part of this initiative, it is interesting to note that the force also targeted not only those who had permanent licenses, but also anyone obtaining an occasional license for an event. The police then explained to them both the law, and their responsibilities under the law, in relation to the provision and sale of alcohol to young people.

3.81 Some of the targeted work focused upon licensees themselves, in terms of providing them with a reminder of the law and their responsibilities, often to prevent the sale of alcohol to underage young people. Some police respondents noted overt or covert surveillance of specific locations, alongside work such as stopping and searching, and interviewing staff. One community safety panel (although not completing a pro forma) also identified an example of a letter which was sent to licensees in their area to remind them of the law in relation to the sale of alcohol to under age young people.

3.82 A city-based initiative was identified through which the police, working with licensees, had agreed that patrons wishing to enter designated licensed premises must submit to a search or they would not be permitted to enter. The main objective of this work was to reduce the number of weapons being taken into licensed premises.

3.83 A further interesting initiative targeting young people was identified in a housing area of a large town, which involved a combination of intensive policing alongside the provision of point of sale information (discussed later) and work with licensees, as well as education and awareness raising work. The law enforcement part of this work was carried out in summer 2001 and was part of an overall project undertaken by a number of agencies in partnership. A very similar initiative was also found in another area.

3.84 A number of examples were also provided of geographical, area-specific, initiatives designed to target alcohol-related disorder being caused by young people. There were 49 examples of initiatives which involved targeting of “hotspots” (i.e. known trouble spots) not only involving young people, but more general problematic drinking and its consequences. In some instances, this related to intensive work in areas with a concentration of nightclubs, or pubs with late licenses. In others it

involved work with shops or in specific geographical areas where there had been previous disorder.

3.85 One example of this work involved a police force targeting initiatives on the basis of locally identified needs. The force concerned identified that it had set up flexible teams to target under age drinking in particular towns and villages. They also identified that, on some occasions, this had been allied to the introduction of specific byelaws.

3.86 A number of police respondents identified that crime pattern analysis had been used to identify both groups of offenders and specific areas. In one case, the force concerned used this analysis as the basis of objections to applications for regular extensions of permitted hours. This had led to a wider initiative, involving a number of law enforcement measures, designed to target both drinking in public and under age drinking, as well as more general street disorder. In another instance, an initiative was identified which was targeted specifically at reducing homophobic attacks in an area.

3.87 A further target for intensive policing / clampdown initiatives was drinking in public, where 7 area-based “clampdown” initiatives were identified as focusing upon this. In a number of these cases, this was tied to the implementation of specific byelaws (discussed later).

3.88 Other initiatives relating to young people involved the development of proof of age schemes, and 34 such schemes were highlighted. As noted previously, The Portman Group has developed a proof of age scheme, but many of the initiatives described in Scotland involved the local development of cards or other forms of identification which would specify the age of the bearer. One Licensing Board noted specifically that it would direct applicants to a proof of age scheme, as well as asking them to declare the procedures which they would implement in order to minimise sales to those under the age of 18.

3.89 One local authority trading standards team identified that the Young Scot card had proved attractive to many young people, and could be used as the basis of a multi-purpose card which would also contain proof of age. The trading standards officers identified that a proof of age card on its own was less likely to be taken up. This had been developed in the local authority area, where it was noted that, since October 2001, over 21,000 cards had been distributed across the area. The card which is used has a photograph and date of birth, and includes the Young Scot benefits along with library, leisure centre and school meals entitlements. This respondent identified that they were aware of similar initiatives now taking place in 3 other authorities (although these were not highlighted in all of the other areas, perhaps as they are at an earlier stage in their development).

3.90 A further local initiative was identified in one town whereby, with the assistance of local schools and businesses, an identity card had been developed which was then made available for young people to buy for £2.00. In another area, examples were given of two individual clubs which operated their own proof of age schemes. All of this targeted work was seen to focus upon specific concerns and to use the

existing legal provisions to control or regulate the availability of alcohol in specific areas or to specific groups.

Information gathering and dissemination

3.91 The use of information gathering and dissemination was also a key aspect of this type of work, and around two thirds (64%) of initiatives in this overall category involved the use of information / intelligence gathering and dissemination to address alcohol-related crime and disorder. This was often linked to the type of targeting discussed above, with police officers becoming more aware of the specific instances of crime in particular areas or among particular groups. In many cases, these initiatives were straightforward, intelligence-led policing, which is a growing part of the work of all forces.

3.92 In terms of more specific work of this type, the initiatives described here included 23 Pubwatch schemes in many different parts of Scotland. These were described in the literature review as involving the use of information-sharing between licensed premises in order to identify the movement of potential troublemakers and to prevent disorder.

3.93 In discussion with the SBPA, it was noted that members across the country get involved in such work at a local level, alongside the police. A similar point was made by the British Institute of Innkeeping which (although not running any specific initiatives in Scotland) noted that members are encouraged to run their pubs in a socially responsible, way and to join schemes and initiatives which promote best practice, including Pubwatch.

3.94 In general, the initiatives which respondents identified in this category were often found to be part of wider initiatives. One example of this was identified where a Pubwatch scheme comprising 14 members was supplemented by an initiative by the local police division to provide regular visits to licensees by plain clothes officers, who would give advice and support. A number of examples were also identified of Pubwatch schemes which worked in conjunction with either a local CCTV system or through a local radio or pager network.

3.95 A small number of initiatives (7) were identified which focused upon making it easier to report crime, sometimes for specific groups. One initiative, for example, focused on lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgender people in one city and encouraged the reporting of homophobic crime. Two examples were also identified of licensees in “high risk” areas being provided with personal radios, in order that they could contact the police directly to report incidents as these developed. A further example was found where an initiative involved the provision of a wristband alarm to women at risk of what was perceived to be alcohol-related domestic abuse, enabling them to summon the police quickly and easily. Other forces in Scotland also provide alarms to women experiencing domestic abuse, and this may be seen to link to some aspects of alcohol-related crime (although it should be stressed that it is not suggested that alcohol is the cause of domestic abuse).

3.96 It is interesting to note that only 4 examples of the use and implementation of CCTV were specifically identified, and only as a component part of a wider initiative. This is perhaps indicative of the extent to which CCTV has now become an integral part of mainstream crime prevention and detection in Scotland. Although some areas may see this as having a role to play, it was not generally identified as a specific initiative to tackle alcohol-related crime and disorder.

3.97 Finally, in relation to the use of information / intelligence, a small number of examples were identified of police forces which had prepared posters highlighting the potential alcohol-related offences (together with penalties) which typically occur in and around licensed premises. This overlaps with some of the point of sale information described later.

Controls on location of drinking

3.98 A much smaller proportion of initiatives in this category (13%) involved some form of control over the location of drinking. As noted earlier, a small number of responses (7) highlighted street drinking as their target. In each of these cases, local byelaws had been implemented as a means of prohibiting this. In total, 12 initiatives were identified which included either the current use, or consideration of the use of byelaws in the future for this purpose.

3.99 As with CCTV, very few respondents mentioned specific initiatives in relation to sporting events. Again, this is most likely because the relevant legislation has now been in force for a number of years and is, in effect, regarded as part of mainstream policing.

3.100 One example was noted, however, of a specific initiative undertaken by one police force in relation to informing licensed clubs, in the area of a newly-promoted premier league football team, of their responsibilities in relation to the enforcement of their membership rules specifically on match days. One force indicated that they had also implemented a policy of voluntary closure of off-licenses and beer gardens in the vicinity of football grounds both before and after matches.

3.101 A further leisure-related initiative was identified whereby a police force had specifically targeted disorder by young people in the vicinity of an ice skating rink. Young people in the area were dispersed and any alcohol confiscated.

Drink driving

3.102 Similarly, a small proportion (11%) of these initiatives involved tackling drink driving, although it should be noted that ACPOS responded to note that all of the police forces in Scotland are involved in tackling drink driving, making this a country-wide initiative (helping to explain the small actual number). The SBPA also noted that tackling drink driving is an area of work in which they are involved.

3.103 Specific initiatives which were identified at the time of the research were of two types. The first involved drink driving campaigns, with the national Scotland-wide festive road safety campaign noted specifically here. This involves all Scottish police forces and includes high profile intelligence-led patrols, targeting drink driving, targeting prominent crash locations and promoting “Crimestoppers”. In addition, one area identified a specific initiative in the summer of 2001 to detect drink driving offenders, especially tourists. This respondent noted that, during a 4 day period, 103 drivers were stopped and 9 offences detected. Other work involved the identification of 8 local designated driver schemes, where the identified driver was provided with complementary soft drinks for the period.

3.104 In the context of general initiatives to address drink driving, the SBPA also drew attention to “Wheelwatch”. This involved the development of a good practice guide for pubs, as well as the provision of advice relating to issues such as alternative drinks for drivers, the identification of ways of enabling drivers to get home safely and other aspects of responsible sales practice as a means of promoting road safety.

3.105 It should be noted here that much of the work to address drink driving involves preventive work which has not been identified here, other than through the national campaign, as the focus is primarily upon regulation and control.

Perceptions of success

3.106 In terms of perceptions of the success of these types of work, 66 initiatives of this type (62%) were seen to have been successful. In around a third of cases (32%), respondents did not indicate whether or not the initiatives were seen to be successful (e.g. where it was too early to identify this). Only 7 believed that the initiatives were not considered to be successful.

3.107 By types of work, it was found that:

- 61% of initiatives to target specific groups or areas were considered successful
- 65% of initiatives using intelligence and information were considered successful
- 64% of initiatives involving controls upon the location of drinking were considered successful
- 58% of initiatives to tackle drink driving were considered successful

3.108 These figures indicate that work was seen to be successful in the majority of cases, and the experiences of respondents indicated that each of these types of work could, in some instances, be a successful way of tackling alcohol-related crime and disorder. The very small number of initiatives perceived as unsuccessful indicates that almost all of those, which were at a stage at which they could identify the impact, considered that this had been positive. There was no identifiable type of initiative perceived as particularly successful or unsuccessful, with all types largely mirroring the overall picture of success or otherwise.

3.109 Some of the additional observations relating to reasons for success of specific types of work are outlined below.

Targeting groups / areas

3.110 As was the case in the first category, few formal evaluations of initiatives had been undertaken, with only two specifying this type of work. One of the police forces noted that, in relation to this, that:

“an independent evaluation of such initiatives [intensive policing / targeting] to identify which ones work best in which situation would be helpful”.

3.111 In relation to “clampdown” type initiatives, for the most part there was little evidence provided of tangible measures of success. In a small number of cases, particularly those linked to violent crime, it was indicated that more time was needed before the impact of the initiatives was properly felt.

3.112 There was, however, a formal evaluation carried out of the multi-agency project identified earlier which was carried out in a housing area of a large town. The evaluation considered all aspects of the work, and noted that the law enforcement element (as was the case with the other work) had been valuable. During the period of the work (June - August 2001), the evaluation report noted that 140 people had been stopped and searched, 23 charged with consumption of alcohol in a public place and 4 people over 18 charged with buying alcohol for under 18s. Although no comparative figures were provided, the work was considered to have been successful.

3.113 In addition, the respondent providing details of the Spotlight initiative noted that there had been an overall drop in reported violent crime of almost 8% compared to the same period in the previous year. All categories of serious violent crime had decreased and this was seen to have been successful. In addition, during the year long initiative, over 5000 knives or weapons had been seized. It was also noted, however, that there remained a problem that the:

“underlying culture of weapon carrying and alcohol misuse will take longer term plans to influence”.

3.114 The respondent reporting the Safer Scotland Violence campaign also noted that violent crime in Scotland fell by almost 8% in the last three months of 2000 (the period of the campaign) and that this, too, was considered as a mark of success. More generally, however, two positive impacts were reported in relation to targeted initiatives. The first was a perceived increase in the number of offenders detected, and the second was an increase in public awareness of the issue. One police force, for example, reported that targeting a specific shopping area had led to:

“a noticeable drop in the amount of calls from the public about the behaviour of youths in the areas covered”.

3.115 A further example was given of an area in which a period of intensive policing had led to a reduction in the number of youths congregating in a hot spot area, and a reduction in the number of calls about their behaviour. High visibility policing in another area in the vicinity of a nightclub at dispersal times, coupled with police visits to food outlets, taxi drivers and licensees, had led to a shorter timespan during which young people were in the town centre after closing time and less “drunken / anti-social” behaviour.

3.116 Generally, it was often suggested that such high visibility policing led to a:

“significant drop in incidents of rowdy behaviour with young people less inclined to become involved in it, due to police presence and policy of one warning only being robustly applied”.

3.117 Other police respondents, however, suggested that a lack of resources and staff shortages could undermine the effectiveness of this type of initiative (although they were considered to be “well worth running”). It was also seen to be important that there was appropriate action taken to supplement high visibility policing, as one respondent noted that an initiative had been unsuccessful since people had become aware of:

“news of no formal action being taken and withdrawal of alcohol counselling. Numbers have increased”.

3.118 Many of these initiatives, however, identified a public perception that the extent of the targeted problem at the end of the work was less than before the initiative was undertaken. Evidence included feedback from local residents and licensees about the extent of, for example, noise-related disorder. One respondent also provided an example of an off-sales license holder who had been reported for selling alcohol to young people who were under age.

3.119 In some cases, additional examples were provided of intangible benefits, for example in terms of perceived improvements in the relationships between the police and either local residents or licensees.

Proof of age

3.120 There was little comment made in relation to the success of local proof of age schemes although one respondent, as noted earlier, suggested that cards were more likely to be used where they did not only focus upon proof of age, but provided young people with other benefits too. In those cases where proof of age cards with additional benefits (such as, for example, discount schemes) were provided, high take up rates of these were reported.

3.121 In addition, a small number of respondents identified that a national proof of age scheme would be beneficial, an issue which was raised previously in the literature review and also emerged in the written consultation for the Plan for Action.

Intelligence gathering

3.122 There was also little formal evaluative information regarding the development of initiatives relating to information and intelligence gathering/sharing. There was again, however, a large amount of anecdotal evidence offered. One police respondent suggested that a Pubwatch early warning scheme:

“has been instrumental in deterring disorderly behaviour on licensed premises”

although the lack of statutory recognition of such schemes was noted.

3.123 One police division reported a small survey which had been carried out on the impact of a Pubwatch scheme on a particular street. A year to year comparison had been undertaken which showed a large reduction in disorder since the introduction of the scheme, which, it was suggested, had increased safety, reduced violent crime and helped to identify trouble makers. A further police force noted a reduction in crimes of violence in premises involved in a scheme in their area, and it was also suggested that there was less “aggro” at the door.

3.124 Another respondent pointed to the involvement of licensees as evidence of the success of such schemes, as:

“they believe that Pubwatch has had a significant effect on the behaviour and attitude of customers in their premises”.

3.125 A further point made by one respondent was that the implementation of Pubwatch schemes in small towns in rural areas could have a very significant impact upon alcohol-related crime and disorder, as it effectively prevented known troublemakers from having any means of socialising outside of their homes.

3.126 One constraint upon Pubwatch which was noted by some police, however, was the reluctance to disclose the particulars of the “culprits” because of fears related to the Data Protection and Human Rights Acts. One respondent suggested, for example, that Pubwatch schemes could be improved by:

“formal recognition, clarification of police involvement in respect of data protection and human rights issues”.

3.127 It was also identified that one of the keys to success in relation to these schemes was the widespread participation of licensees in a local area. For example:

“if one breaks the link in this chain, then it provides an outlet for offenders to socialise”.

3.128 A number of respondents identified that a particular success of Pubwatch schemes had been the fact that the local pub managers now talked with each other regularly about shared issues and problems, and were able to discuss these with a nominated police officer. For example, as one respondent suggested:

“we now have 14 pub managers who talk to each other regularly and are able to talk to a police officer who is known and trusted by them”.

3.129 In terms of the use of CCTV, one respondent noted that this had led to a significant reduction in vandalism and anti-social behaviour in the area, as well as providing public reassurance. A number of “spin off” benefits of CCTV were also identified by one police force. It was noted that the use of CCTV made it much easier to establish the development of alcohol-related violent incidents over time. This was perceived to have two benefits. The first related to ensuring that the correct persons were charged and appropriate charges made. More widely, this force also identified that it had used CCTV footage as part of the process of educating licensees, servers and door staff about ways in which the development of alcohol-related incidents could be averted at an early stage. One respondent suggested that mobile CCTV may be more cost-effective and beneficial for large rural areas.

Locations / drink driving

3.130 The same pattern of lack of formal evidence emerged in relation to the initiatives reported to address locations of drinking and drink driving. There was no evidence provided of the formal evaluation of initiatives to address street drinking, but again police information was useful and anecdotal evidence was provided. One respondent noted, in this context, the difficulties in monitoring and measuring the impact of such work.

3.131 In terms of the use of byelaws, it was noted by one Licensing Board that these can:

“remove drunken rowdy persons from streets and prevent unlawful behaviour at an early stage”.

3.132 A further respondent suggested, however, that:

“the effectiveness of these byelaws varies in relation to the nature and extent of problems being experienced and it is acknowledged that byelaws alone are not a panacea for eliminating anti-social behaviour”. Nevertheless, they are an extremely useful tool and a valuable addition to any long term strategy”.

3.133 The same respondent noted that the prohibition of street drinking had helped to reduce violence involving the use of glassware outside of licensed premises. One police respondent noted the difficulty of eliminating disorder linked to street drinking, however, suggesting that there remained an ongoing problem in that area, despite work to address this.

3.134 In relation to drink driving, the impact of the festive campaign, in terms of the number of convictions, had not been assessed by the point at which this research was carried out. It was suggested, however, that there was heightened public awareness of

the issue. There had been one formal evaluation of driver training undertaken as part of a drink/ driving initiative. This indicated that 100% of participants felt that they had a clearer view of the road safety issues involved, and that there had been a significant decline in conviction rates.

General issues

3.135 The importance of joint working was again seen to be important in initiatives which fell into this category. In the 7 cases where initiatives aimed at specific groups, geographical areas and types of crime were not considered to be successful, four issues emerged:

- Initiatives trying to address too many issues within too short a time
- Lack of sufficient funding
- Lack of impact on offending behaviour
- Lack of public support for the initiative, with the police and shop owners seen as “over reacting”

Generally, however, there was a positive view of the impact of targeted initiatives upon alcohol-related crime and disorder.

INITIATIVES RELATING TO THE ENVIRONMENT / CONTEXT OF ALCOHOL CONSUMPTION

3.136 The literature review identified the third category as comprising the use of measures to regulate the context or environment of alcohol consumption. This was highlighted as an area on which there had been a growing focus, and over a quarter of the initiatives which were found in Scotland included work relating to this type of objective. These measures were found to include:

- Staff training
- Point of sale information and health warnings
- Changes to the physical environment
- Control of the promotion of alcohol
- The materials used (e.g. toughened glass / control of bottles)

3.137 A total of 57 examples were identified of initiatives which undertook this type of work, comprising 28% of all of the initiatives undertaken. It was found, as has been the case in the other categories, that the initiatives identified in Scotland were largely consistent with the types of work which were identified in the literature review. The types of work which were identified here are detailed in Table 9.

Table 9. Types of work

Type of work	Number	% total of this type
Server / license holder training	35	61
Design / layout	16	28
Door steward training / registration	13	23
Use of specific materials	10	18
Point of sale information	5	9
Control of promotion	4	7

3.138 Table 9 identifies clearly that the main focus of work relating to the drinking environment has been upon staff training. As was the case in the other initiatives described, much of this work was combined with other work within the other categories.

Target behaviours

3.139 The initiatives in this category identified a range of types of behaviour which would be addressed by the work (see Table 10).

Table 10. Target behaviours

Behaviour	Number	% total
Violence and aggression	40	74
Binge drinking and drunkenness	33	61
Under age drinking	32	59
Availability of alcohol	29	54
Noise	18	33
Other specific behaviour	15	28
Drinking and driving	11	20
Environmental damage	9	17
Other	9	17
Not answered	3	5

3.140 The perceived links between the drinking environment and issues such as violence / aggression, binge drinking and under age drinking (which were identified in the literature review) were clear from the targets of these initiatives. In addition, many respondents clearly shared the view that there was an opportunity for developments in staff training and improvements to the design of licensed premises to impact upon such problems, and this has been translated into the development of initiatives of this type in Scotland.

3.141 The reasons for the development of these initiatives were again varied, and included:

- Identified public concern

- Public consultation
- Discussions with licensees
- Community Safety Partnerships
- Local implementation of national initiatives

Specific examples

3.142 As in the previous categories, some more specific examples of the work which was carried out are given below.

Staff training

3.143 Of the staff training identified, this was most commonly for servers / license holders but also, in several cases, for door stewards. Server and licensee training schemes were identified across Scotland, with many respondents drawing attention to the use of Servewise (and the earlier Server Intervention Programmes) in their local area. In these cases, examples were given of training being provided to local trainers by a Servewise Co-ordinator, to allow them to subsequently provide this to staff and licensees. The response from Alcohol Focus Scotland noted that courses for on-licenses and off-licenses are provided by 35 Servewise centres (which include colleges of further education, training organisations and the licensed trade). All of the trainers are licensed and trained by Alcohol Focus Scotland before delivering the training in their own areas. The SBPA respondent also noted that the Association encourages staff training amongst members as an aspect of good practice.

3.144 A small number of local door steward registration schemes were identified, where training provision was linked to this. These schemes, in turn (as noted earlier), were sometimes linked to the provision of extensions to opening hours. An example of targeted training to door stewards for one-off events was also provided in one area. Local training was provided to organisations (community associations and agencies) running community events. This involved a four hour course which covered issues such as alcohol and drugs, basic first aid, safety and “people handling”.

3.145 One Licensing Board provided details by letter of their policy on acceptance as a fit and proper person to be a licensee, with the introduction of this policy following discussions with a range of organisations with an interest in this issue. The policy document suggested that it would be used in assessing applicants, and specified (amongst other requirements) a need for the applicant to have undergone training on the management and control of licensed premises, or to do so within three months of the grant of the license.

3.146 Another Licensing Board provided information by letter about a policy to be introduced at the start of 2002 to make training mandatory for all licensees. Following the introduction of the policy, applicants will require to provide a certificate to demonstrate attendance at a recognised and appropriate training course.

3.147 An earlier part of this chapter has discussed the use of staff training as part of the imposition of conditions upon granting licenses. A small number of cases were identified where staff training was also included in wider environment-related initiatives such as:

- The development of good practice guidance
- Initiatives aimed specifically at a group of licensees, such as minority ethnic licensees (one piece of work, for example sought to identify and address issues affecting this group)
- Initiatives designed to promote more general “responsible retailing” (which clearly overlaps, to some extent with work such as the control of promotions)

3.148 One specific example was identified of training for license holders which was promoted jointly by a college and trade association. A further instance was identified of training being provided to off-license staff in businesses operating a voluntary minimum alcohol purchase age of 21.

3.149 Generally, these initiatives involved a straightforward staff training process to improve staff understanding of the relevant issues and to equip them with the skills necessary to deal with situations (including alcohol-related crime and disorder) which they might encounter in their work.

Attractive outlets / design and layout

3.150 A total of 16 initiatives were identified which involved specific work relating to the design and layout of licensed premises. In most cases this involved raising awareness amongst licensees and staff of the ways in which the environment and the layout could impact upon reducing the risk of disorder. Staff then implemented these changes as far as possible.

3.151 Two specific examples were identified of initiatives taken by police forces to provide proactive advice to license holders and / or architects. These initiatives involved a number of licensed premises across areas. A further initiative involved a joint approach by a police force and a nightclub operator in order to develop new premises as a model of best practice in using architectural design as a means of minimising the likelihood of disorder both inside and outside. The nightclub was focusing on the physical design and management of the premises, as well as other factors. Yet another initiative involved a police Architectural Liaison Officer providing “influence and expertise” on the design of buildings at the planning stage. The service was provided free to all architects.

3.152 A specific initiative which impacted upon the promotion of a more attractive overall environment was also identified. This focused upon the removal of graffiti and the effects of vandalism in an area. Instances of problems were collated by the Community Safety Co-ordinator in the area, and referred to the appropriate organisation for action.

3.153 One Licensing Board noted that, when consideration was given to regular extensions to permitted hours, they requested a management statement about:

“the availability of alternatives to alcohol, food provision, training for bar staff, provision for underage persons, no smoking areas, smoke precipitators or extractors and what stewarding is to be available for each event, the amount of male and female stewarding and where they are to be located in the premises”.

All of these factors were seen to provide a means of controlling the nature of the drinking environment.

Use of specific materials

3.154 Ten initiatives highlighted the use of specific materials. In most cases, this related to the use of toughened glass in licensed premises. In a number of cases, this was linked to voluntary restrictions on the types of alcohol container which could be sold for off-sales through pubs.

3.155 One example was provided of a Licensing Board which had introduced a policy whereby premises were obliged to use toughened glass as a condition of their license. It was suggested that (as noted earlier) this had reduced the likelihood of serious injury where glassware was used in an assault. Another respondent noted by letter that non-glass drinking vessels must be available on request for children. Another example was identified of a voluntary restriction accepted by landlords in one area in relation to not serving any drinks in bottles within one hour of closing time. It was indicated that this initiative was linked to work by stewards within these premises taking steps to identify whether any glass containers were being removed by patrons.

Control of promotions

3.156 A very small number of specific initiatives (4) were aimed specifically at the control of promotions (although these covered a large number of licensed premises). Such work generally involved the provision of advice and good practice information to licensees to allow self-regulation. The SBPA also noted that it was involved in the provision of information to all of its members in relation to responsible practices, with the development of a good practice guide on promotions.

3.157 As noted earlier, one Licensing Board also indicated that it made it clear to licensees that “happy hours” are:

“the epitome of drinking for drinking’s sake and contrary to the philosophy of civilised drinking”.

Another also noted that they had expressed their concerns in relation to discounted alcohol and have had these views drawn to license holders’ attention.

3.158 One respondent suggested that:

“in [area] an acceptable level of drink promotion in licensed premises currently exists. Where singular extraordinary promotions can be linked to problems with disorder, a letter highlighting police concerns is generally submitted to the licensee”.

3.159 Two Licensing Boards noted by letter that when children’s certificates were granted, among the conditions were that there would be no “happy hour” or similar promotions in operation during the hours when the children’s certificate was in force. One example was identified in a local area of the ongoing development of a code of practice for licensees. This code of practice had arisen from a joint initiative by the Licensing Board and trade, and was expected to include provisions relating to both pricing policies and drinks promotions.

Point of sale information

3.160 Five initiatives were identified which were aimed at the provision of point of sale information. In one of these cases, this involved the provision of information on beer mats across a local area. In another, this involved the provision of offences notices and guidelines by the police (with posters and notices circulated to all license holders) with the intention that these should be displayed at licensed premises. One area circulated “Behave or Be Banned” posters to licensees for display.

3.161 In the third and fourth cases, the provision of information for display was provided as part of a wider initiative which involved law enforcement, community involvement and educational work alongside this. In these cases, licensees were given window and till stickers, and posters, with the “no sales to under-18s” message. In one of the initiatives, adults who bought alcohol were also given a flyer to remind them of the law in relation to purchasing alcohol for under-18s.

3.162 It is recognised that the use of point of sale information overlaps with some elements of education / awareness raising work, rather than specifically involving control and regulation, and it is likely that this may be the reason for the relatively low number of initiatives of this type which were highlighted.

Other work

3.163 One Licensing Board noted by letter that they had developed a set of byelaws which stipulate that no sectarian or racist singing, or playing of racist or sectarian music (live or recorded), will take place on licensed premises. The byelaws also stipulate that no literature or objects of a sectarian nature are to be displayed in any part of the licensed premises which are accessible to or can be seen by members of the public.

Perceptions of success

3.164 In terms of perceptions of the success of these types of work, 35 (62%) of initiatives of this type were seen to have been successful. The remainder did not respond to this question (for example, where an initiative was still underway), while none in this category believed the initiative to have been unsuccessful.

3.165 By types of work, it was found that:

- 63% of staff training initiatives were considered successful
- 81% of design / layout initiatives were considered successful
- 60% of initiatives involving the use of particular materials were considered successful
- Two of the four initiatives relating to promotions were considered successful (while the others were at a relatively early stage)
- The initiatives relating to point of sale information were considered successful

3.166 A relatively high proportion of design / layout initiatives stated positively that they had been successful but the small numbers, and the fact that some of those of other types were still ongoing, make it impossible to suggest that these were more successful than other forms of work. It should be reiterated that none of the initiatives in this category were considered unsuccessful, giving a very high level of success amongst those initiatives which were in a position to identify this.

3.167 Few comments were made relating to observations of the reasons for success (or comments on examples of good practice) for initiatives of this type, but some of the issues raised are outlined below.

Staff training

3.168 Although there was limited evidence of formal evaluations of any of the overall initiatives in this category, it was indicated that some of the staff training (for example, individual workshops, seminars or courses) had generally indicated positive outcomes. The results of these evaluations were described as having provided positive feedback and it was noted that there was a perception that many licensees considered the training to be useful. Examples of positive feedback from both the licensed trade and the police were provided. In addition, examples were given of an increase in searches being carried out by door stewards and generally higher levels of awareness of staff responsibilities and involvement.

3.169 More specific information was provided in relation to Servewise, which had been evaluated very positively at the pilot stage by the University of Paisley. In addition, it was reported that ongoing internal evaluation of Servewise has also proved positive.

3.170 The issue which was raised most frequently was in relation to participation in both strands of training (servers / licensees and door stewards). Although, in general terms, all respondents who were able to offer a view indicated that the initiatives had

been successful, there was nonetheless a concern that the impact, in some cases, was lessened by the fact that training was, in effect, largely voluntary. In this context, it was noted that many Licensing Boards did not insist on training (although examples of the ways in which some of the Boards have done so were provided earlier).

3.171 It has been suggested that the consequence of the (largely) voluntary participation has been that take up has not always been as high as had been anticipated or as would have been preferred. One respondent noted, for example, that:

“some areas do have less success though, if participants (potential) don’t respond ... particularly if they are from premises known to have more problems”.

The SBPA respondent also noted that one of the key challenges for the future is to secure the participation in training of individual retailers, whose time is limited and upon whom there are already seen to be considerable legislative demands.

3.172 As noted previously, the issue of securing staff participation in initiatives where this was not a condition of their license was raised frequently. In this context, a number of respondents indicated that, in their view, training (particularly for door stewards, but also for new licensees) should be mandatory and always a condition of the granting of a license. Added to this, there should be a requirement in law for training to national standards, with, for example, the suggestion that there should be:

“legislative change to make an element of training compulsory as part of meeting the fit and proper test”.

3.173 This issue was raised, more generally, by one Board in relation to successful local work, with the need for:

“formal endorsement.... under new licensing legislation”.

3.174 One Licensing Board also pointed to the need for training for license holders to be updated on a regular basis, and another for local training to be accredited. Alcohol Focus Scotland also pointed to the need to have training provision as a requirement, but for only properly vetted courses to be accepted.

3.175 The need for resources to co-ordinate trainers and to undertake marketing of the provision was also noted. One respondent also pointed to the need for diversity training for licensees and staff.

Attractive environment / design and layout

3.176 Design initiatives were generally seen to have had an impact upon alcohol-related crime and disorder. The use of the police Architectural Liaison Officer, for example, was seen to have been an effective means of promoting such developments, with this approach noted as:

“proven to reduce crime and influence behaviour”,

although no statistical evidence was provided to support this perception.

3.177 Specific comments were also made relating to the initiative which focused upon graffiti removal. During the first 6 months of the pilot project, it was found that vandalism had been reduced by 42%. Reported vandalism in the area was down by 21% in the first year. The only suggested improvement to this initiative was that there could be increased commitment to the removal of burned out vehicles.

Control of promotions

3.178 There was little information provided in relation to the success of work to regulate promotions. Only one respondent commented upon this, where it was noted that there had been an attempt to introduce a voluntary code to address this issue, but many of the licensees in the areas had not been interested in participating in this.

Point of sale information

3.179 One of the projects using point of sale information had completed a formal evaluation of the whole project. In the course of that evaluation, the views of licensees were sought both in relation to the use of the information and the effectiveness of the work. The survey found a high level of use of the material by licensees, the majority of whom considered that this had been useful in deterring sales of alcohol to under 18s. There was also evidence of retailers passing information to others, and the evaluation report concluded that all groups involved in the project welcomed this and wanted to see it continuing.

Use of materials

3.180 The use of toughened glass was generally viewed positively when used along with other measures. One police force, for example, noted a reduction in their area in serious injuries from bottles (although actual figures were not provided). In another area, the police respondent reported that:

“in the policing year 1999-2000 there were 19 serious assaults in the city centre where bottles / glasses were used. This fell to 5 for the year 2000-2001”.

3.181 Where premises no longer sold alcohol in bottles one hour before the conclusion of permitted hours, it was noted that this had:

“reduced the number of incidents of glass bottles being smuggled outside premises”.

3.182 A concern was, however, highlighted by one police force about the current lack of British Standard for toughened glass, with the suggestion that this may potentially undermine initiatives of this kind. One police respondent pointed to the need to ensure that more publicans use toughened glass, along with the need for national pressure to ensure that producers use toughened glass for bottles. It is also worth noting, however, that a crime pattern analysis undertaken by one force suggested that broken glass may account for as little as 10% of the injuries presented at a local Accident and Emergency department following alcohol-related disorder (with many relating, for example, to the use of other weapons, such as belt buckles etc.).

3.183 Although, therefore, the use of such materials was seen as an appropriate initiative, the importance of using this in combination with other measures was evident and, as one police officer suggested:

“this is not a panacea”.

This view was consistent with the issues raised in the literature review.

General

3.184 In terms of general comments, it was noted by one police force that their policy on sponsorship precluded cash contributions being made to police initiatives by trade organisations and private interests, and limited their involvement in some work. This meant that this force had to seek (and had been successful in securing) a range of “in kind” inputs, such as distribution of materials, input of staff time and items such as t-shirts etc. from trade and industry representatives.

3.185 Again, however, as with other areas, the importance of joint / partnership working was stressed in relation to increasing the success of initiatives to develop or improve the drinking environment. The SBPA, for example, stressed that staff become involved in discussion and implementation of many initiatives of this type and the value of co-operation in securing success was emphasised.

OTHER WORK

3.186 Although the focus of this research was on initiatives relating to regulation and control of alcohol and the drinking environment, it was noted earlier that many respondents reported other types of work which were aimed specifically at reducing alcohol related crime and disorder. All of the work reported did focus upon crime and disorder, rather than comprising more general preventive work. Although this was not central to the focus of this report, a brief summary of the initiatives in this category may, nonetheless, be of interest. These “other” initiatives generally involved preventive work and service provision, and examples included:

- Public education

- School based education and awareness raising in a range of forms, including primary and secondary schools
- Arrangement of conferences, seminars and other awareness raising events
- Counselling
- Street and outreach work
- Peer education
- Groupwork programmes
- Provision of low cost leisure alternatives or promotion of healthy lifestyle options
- Service provision to people with alcohol-related problems
- Developments in good practice in assessment
- Designated places
- Awareness-raising
- Information production and provision in a range of forms including posters, CDs videos and leaflets
- The use of diversion from prosecution by the courts
- The use of pre-court diversion by the police
- Support to specific groups of offenders
- Appointment of specialist staff

3.187 In addition, a number of respondents identified that large scale preventive work (such as the Scottish Executive TV advert “Lily the Pink” and a series of radio advertisements promoted by Strathclyde Police as part of the Spotlight Campaign) could have an additional impact on alcohol-related crime and disorder, although they did not focus directly upon this.

3.188 A total of 61 initiatives comprised only “other” work. The remaining 26 initiatives in this category provided an additional element to initiatives being carried out in one of the three relevant categories described previously. Examples of the ways in which these combined with regulation and control included:

- Public education used alongside a “clampdown” on specific behaviour” to encourage understanding of the issues and to contribute to the overall effort to reduce the problem identified
- Visits to schools used alongside specific initiatives targeting, for example, street drinking and alcohol-related disorder amongst young people
- Production of leaflets and posters to accompany intensive policing and raise wider awareness of the issues

3.189 From this, it can be seen that these “other” initiatives generally involved preventive work or the provision of services to people with alcohol problems. Two initiatives were identified, however, which involved the direct provision of transport. In one case, this involved the provision of subsidised transport to young people to allow them to maximise their use of non alcohol-based leisure facilities. In the other, this involved the purchase by a nightclub operator of dedicated transport (minibuses) to carry patrons home.

3.190 The value of these forms of work was also stressed, with some providing details of evaluation work which had been carried out. In the context of this report, however, the inclusion of these initiatives serves to emphasise the importance of conducting a range of different types of work in combination to address alcohol-related crime and disorder.

OVERVIEW

3.191 This chapter has outlined some of the current and recent initiatives in Scotland to tackle alcohol-related crime and disorder. It is clear that these reflect the areas covered in the literature review, with the largest proportion of work undertaken focusing upon law enforcement, and regulation of availability and consumption of alcohol for specific groups, or in particular areas.

3.192 Taken together, the information from the literature review and the data from initiatives in Scotland provide an indication of some of the work of this type which can be considered to be effective in tackling alcohol-related crime and disorder. The final chapter summarises the implications of these findings.

CHAPTER 4: SUMMARY OF ISSUES RAISED

4.1 The information which has been presented in the previous chapters of this report has provided details both of international studies, and work which has taken place in Scotland, which help to inform the debate in relation to the appropriate use of measures for the control and regulation of alcohol. These issues will be considered in detail by the sub-group of the Nicholson Committee, and the information which has been gathered will assist in this process.

4.2 Given the purpose of this report, it would clearly be inappropriate to draw definitive conclusions and recommendations from these findings, as that will form a part of the deliberations of the sub-group and Committee. Instead, this final chapter of the report provides a brief summary of some of the main issues which are raised by the material presented.

THE EVIDENCE PRESENTED

4.3 For the purposes of this report, the types of work explored in the literature review and identified as taking place in Scotland were grouped into three broad categories:

- Initiatives to control the availability of alcohol through licensing (including, for example, the imposition of conditions upon licenses, work to address opening hours or other aspects of the sale of alcohol)
- Regulation of aspects of consumption, initiatives to tackle specific groups or crimes and the enforcement of existing law (including, for example, drinking in certain locations, under age drinking, drink driving, etc.)
- Regulation of the environment / context of alcohol consumption (including, for example, staff training and registration, use of toughened glass and design changes)

4.4 The literature review suggested that there have been a range of studies of the effectiveness of measures to regulate and control alcohol sales and consumption. As noted within the review, the evidence is not always clear, and there is sometimes a need for caution in applying the results directly to Scotland. Despite these caveats, however, the literature provides an indication of some of the changes which can be seen to have an impact upon crime and disorder. There has also been work of all three types undertaken in Scotland, and this, too, provides an indication of perceptions of success. These issues are summarised below for initiatives of each type.

Addressing the general sale and consumption of alcohol

4.5 There is a continuing debate about whether it is appropriate to focus upon measures which regulate and control the general availability and consumption of alcohol, and those which target specific groups and forms of behaviour. The Plan for Action favours an approach which undertakes some population-wide work, particularly in terms of raising awareness, alongside more specific initiatives with

particular issues or groups causing concern. This reflects a growing trend away from measures to control the availability of alcohol on a population-wide basis towards a more targeted approach.

4.6 In terms of the evidence of measures to restrict consumption generally, however, although the link between these issues and alcohol related crime is clearly complex, the findings suggest that:

- Longer hours of alcohol sales may be linked to increased problems with alcohol-related crime and disorder, as well as alcohol problems more generally, but the evidence from the UK and Scotland is mixed
- Staggered closing times may have an impact on disorder by reducing the number of people on the streets at the same time, and may assist with the management of disorder where this occurs, although local circumstances need to be taken into account
- There is limited evidence in relation to curfews, but these may have some impact upon disorder
- Although there is an overall lack of data, and problems of measurement, some studies suggest that lowering the age at which people can drink alcohol on licensed premises can reduce the likelihood of young people drinking in unsafe and unsupervised locations. There is also evidence, however, that lowering the age can raise the levels of male juvenile crime, and raising the age can reduce alcohol related car crashes and fatalities. There is also evidence that age restrictions on purchase and consumption of alcohol can have an impact upon harm, but enforcement is a key aspect of this
- There is evidence of a link between the number of outlets selling alcohol and levels of alcohol-related problems, and limitation of the numbers may have an effect on alleviating problems
- There is some evidence that different types of outlet may experience different levels and types of alcohol-related crime / disorder
- There is currently a general lack of evidence of the impact of alcohol advertising on alcohol-related harm and a need for research in this area, although there may be some effect of advertising on young people
- There is a link between alcohol price and consumption, but little direct evidence (with the exception of one study) of the impact of this upon alcohol-related crime and disorder
- This category was the area of work in which the smallest number of initiatives had been undertaken in Scotland. The reasons for this are likely to include the need for legislative change to enable much of the work in this category to take place and the widespread coverage of individual initiatives
- Where such work has taken place, examples have been provided of the imposition of conditions upon extension of opening hours and the provision of local guidelines about permitted extensions. There were also some examples of the use of curfews and the consideration of outlet density when new licenses were granted
- The majority of initiatives in this category in Scotland were considered to have been successful, particularly where there had been partnership working

between those involved and co-operation. There was, however, found to be a lack of evidence from systematic evaluation

Addressing the consumption of alcohol by particular groups and in particular locations

- Although the initiatives undertaken in this category fell within the existing legislative framework, the Nicholson Committee will require to consider whether any further changes to the law could enhance the positive effects of law enforcement
- High profile policing and enforcement of the law relating to under age drinking has been found to be linked to a reduction in the number of crimes and arrests, although there is mixed evidence of the impact of test purchasing
- High profile policing around some licensed premises can be associated with a reduction in arrests and crime rates
- There is some evidence to support community enforcement programmes, although the effect may not be sustained in the longer term, and some suggest a need for these measures to be combined with formal measures
- There appears to be a common perception of the value of proof of age schemes
- It has been suggested that the enforcement of server laws in relation, for example, to customers who are intoxicated, may also impact upon crime and disorder
- Pubwatch schemes appear to have some success in the reduction of alcohol-related disorder, sometimes alongside other measures; for example, the dissemination of information, exclusion orders and the use of CCTV
- No formal evaluation evidence was identified of the effect of prohibition of drinking alcohol at sporting events, but there is some evidence to suggest that the prohibition of drinking in public places has had some success in addressing alcohol-related crime and disorder, particularly where this is combined with other measures
- Actions to address drink driving described in the report have been generally found to be successful, particularly when they are enforced vigorously and have a high public profile
- The largest amount of work in Scotland was found to be taking place in relation to the enforcement of the law, and targeting specific groups and areas, in order to regulate availability and consumption of alcohol amongst them
- Young people were identified frequently as a target, as were specific geographical areas which were seen to be “hotspots”
- Information-gathering was identified as a vital aspect of law enforcement initiatives, with measures also being undertaken to encourage reporting of crime
- There were examples of work being undertaken through Pubwatch schemes
- There were many local examples of the operation of proof of age schemes
- As with the first category, there is a shortage of formal evaluation taking place in Scotland, making it difficult to identify the actual impact of the work upon alcohol-related crime and disorder

- There was, however, a perception amongst many of the respondents that there was anecdotal evidence to suggest success in relation to reducing crime and disorder as well as, in some case, improving local relationships

Changing the drinking environment and the context of consumption

- Overcrowding, poor bar layout / inconvenient access, a permissive environment, bar workers who fail to practice responsible serving and inappropriate promotions that encourage heavy / binge drinking have been found to contribute to alcohol-related aggression.
- Staff / server training, particularly where this is backed by management, used to enforce legislation and repeated regularly, has been identified as a means of helping to prevent and deal with alcohol-related crime disorder, including under age drinking and drink driving.
- There is some evidence to suggest that door staff can also have an impact on alcohol-related crime and disorder.
- There are identifiable aspects of the physical design of premises which can reduce alcohol-related crime and disorder, with attractive outlets, outlets serving food and outlets with a range of design features seen to have role in making this less likely.
- There is limited evidence of the impact of server liability, although it is suggested that this has encouraged staff training in some countries (which, as seen, can have an impact upon alcohol-related crime and disorder)
- There is little evidence of the impact of health warning information, which is considered unlikely to have a significant impact without other measures
- It has been suggested that inappropriate promotions can contribute to alcohol-related disorder
- The use of toughened glass can have an impact on the number of “glassing” attacks and facial injuries
- Work relating to the drinking environment in Scotland was also identified, particularly in relation to server training, which was found to be taking part in many areas
- Initiatives were also identified, however, which involved the use of toughened glass, and the use of the physical layout and environment, to address crime and disorder
- These initiatives were generally perceived to be successful, although it was noted that it may, in some cases, be difficult to secure voluntary participation for staff training
- As with other types of work, there was a general lack of evaluation of the initiatives taking place in Scotland with which to measure the impact of these measures systematically

THE IMPLICATIONS OF THE FINDINGS

4.7 The implications of the findings presented here will require to be considered in the context of the ways in which the legislation can be used (or requires to be

changed) in order to promote the practices which have the clearest impact upon alcohol-related crime and disorder.

4.8 As noted earlier, the findings of this study can assist in informing these considerations.

The need for further research

4.9 It was stressed repeatedly in the collection of evidence to inform the Plan for Action that there is a need for research to inform the development of work in the future. The final issue which is implied by the findings presented here is that there remains a need for the evaluation of work which is undertaken, whether in Scotland or internationally. The literature review identified a number of areas in which there is currently limited evaluation data, and this was borne out by the work undertaken in Scotland, where almost none of the work carried out was identified as having been evaluated (with a small number of exceptions).

4.10 In the context of alcohol-related crime and disorder, there is a clear need for experimental and ongoing work to develop/use measures which provide clear information relating to the impact of initiatives upon relevant behaviour and activities. This will assist in future planning in the longer term.

4.11 In the meantime, however, the information within this report provides an evidence base (although limited) for the current work of the Nicholson Committee.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- All Party Group on Alcohol Misuse (1995) *“Alcohol and Crime : Breaking the Link”* London.
- Buka, S; and Birdthistle, I; (1999) *“Long Term Effects of a Community Wide Alcohol Server Training Intervention”* **Journal of Studies on Alcohol**, 1999, 60;1
- Bushman, B.J. (1997) *“Effects of Alcohol on Human Aggression : Validity of Proposed Explanations”* in M. Galanter (ed) *“Recent Developments in Alcoholism, Alcohol and Violence”* New York. Plenum.
- Catalyst Health Economics Consultants Ltd (2001) *“Alcohol Misuse in Scotland : Trends and Costs”* Scottish Executive
- Clayson, C. (1984) *“Licensing Law and Health : The Scottish Experience”* **Action on Alcohol Abuse Licensing Law and Health** London. Action on Alcohol Abuse.
- Coben, J. and Larkin, G. (1999) *“Effectiveness of Ignition Interlock Devices in Reducing Drunk Driving and Recidivism”* in **American Journal of Preventative Medicine** No. 16 (1S) pp 81-87
- Deehan (1999) *“Alcohol and Crime : Taking Stock”* London. HMSO.
- Edwards, G., Anderson, P and Babor T. et al (1994) *“Alcohol Policy and the Public Good”* Oxford University Press (1994)
- Graham, K., LaRocque, L., Yetman, R., Ross, T. and Guistra, E. (1980) *“Aggression and Bar Room Environments”* **Journal of Studies on Alcohol** Vol 41 pp277-292
- Graham, C. McLeod, L. and Steedman, D. (1998) *“Restricting Extensions to Permitted Licensing Hours Does Not Influence the Numbers of Alcohol or Assault Related Attendances at an Inner City Accident and Emergency Department”* **Journal of Accident and Emergency Medicine** No.15 pp23-25
- Grube, J.W. (1997) *“Preventing Sales of Alcohol to Minors : Results from a Community Trial”* **Addiction** No. 92 (Supplement 2) S251-S260
- Gruenwald, P., Ponicki, W. and Holder, H. (1993) *“The Relationship of Outlet Densities to Alcohol Consumption : A Time Series Cross Sectional Analysis”* **Alcoholism : Clinical and Experimental Research** No. 17 pp38-47
- Hauritz, M., Homel, R., McIlwain, G., Burrows, T. and Townsley, M. (1998) *“Reducing Violence in Licensed Venues through Community Safety Action Projects : The Queensland Experience”* **Contemporary Drug Problems** 25
- Hoffman, J. (1998) *“Alcohol Ban a Success”* **Law and Order** March 1998 pp107-108
- Holder, H. and Wagenaar, A. (1994) *“Mandated Server Training and the Reduction of Alcohol-Involved Traffic Crashes : A Time Series Analysis of the Oregon Experience”* **Accident Analysis and Prevention** No. 26 pp89-97
- Homel, R. and Clarke, J. (1994) *“The Prediction and Prevention of Violence in Pubs and Clubs”* in R.V. Clarke (ed) **Crime Prevention Studies** Vol. 3 New York Criminal Justice Press pp1-46

Home Office (2000) *“Tackling Alcohol Related Crime, Disorder and Nuisance”* London. HMSO.

Home Office (2001) *“Crime Reduction Toolkits : Alcohol and Crime”* London. HMSO.

Hope, T. (1986) *“Liquor Licensing and Crime Prevention”* **Home Office Research and Planning Unit Research Bulletin** No.20 pp 5-8

Ireland, S. (1995) *“Alcohol and its Contribution to Violence”* **Australian Violence Contemporary Perspectives** No 2 155-180

Jeffs, B. and Saunders, W. (1983) *“Minimising Alcohol Related Offences by Enforcement of the Existing Legislation”* **British Journal of Addiction** No. 78 pp67-77

Levy, D. T. and Miller, T.R. (1995) *“A Cost-Benefit Analysis of Enforcement Efforts to Reduce Serving Intoxicated Patrons”* in **Journal of Studies on Alcohol** 1995 No. 56: pp 40-47

Lewis, R., Paine-Andrews, A., Fawcett, S., Francisco, V., Richter, K., Copple, B. and Copple, J. (1996) *“Evaluating the Effects of a Community Coalition’s Efforts to Reduce Illegal Sales of Alcohol and Tobacco Products to Minors”* **Journal of Community Health** Vol 21 No.6

Lovatt, A. (1996) *“Soft City, Hard City? : The Flexibility of Permitted Hours for UK Cities”* **24Hour City Conference Leeds** (cited in Raistrick et al, eds *“Tackling Alcohol Together”*)

MacAskill, S., Cooke, E. and Hastings, G. (2001) *“Prevention of Alcohol Misuse : Informing the Strategy – Report of a Two Day Deliberative Expert Seminar”* University of Strathclyde Centre for Social Marketing

Markowitz, S. (2000) *“Criminal Violence and Alcohol Beverage Control: Evidence from an International Study”* **NBER Working Paper 7481** National Bureau of Economic Research Cambridge MA

Marsh, P. and Fox Kibby, K. (1992) *“Drinking and Public Disorder”* Oxford. Alden Press. (For The Portman Group.)

Martin, S. (2001) *“The Links Between Alcohol, Crime and the Criminal Justice System ; Explanations, Evidence and Interventions”* **American Journal on Addictions** 10 : 136-158

McArthur, D. L. and Kraus, J. (1999) *“The Specific Deterrence of Administrative per se Laws in Reducing Drunk Driving Recidivism”* in **American Journal of Preventative Medicine** 1999 No. 16 (1S) pp68-75

Miller et al (1998) *“Costs and Benefits of a Community Sobriety Checkpoint Program”* in **Journal of Studies on Alcohol** 1998 No. 59 : pp 462-468

NFO System Three (2001) *“Alcohol Misusers and Their Families and Friends”* Scottish Executive, Edinburgh

NFO System Three (2001) *“Scottish Opinion Survey Alcohol Misuse : Tabulations”* Scottish Executive, Edinburgh

- Nordlund, S. (1985) *“Effects of Saturday Closing of Wine and Spirit Shops in Norway”*. Rome. Paper presented at the **31st International Institute on the**
- Norstrom, T (2000) *“Outlet Density and Criminal Violence in Norway, 1960-1995”* **Journal of Studies on Alcohol**, 2000 61:6
- Prevention and Treatment of Alcoholism.** Cited in Raistrick (1999)
- Office of Population Censuses and Surveys (1986) *“Drinking and Attitudes to Licensing in Scotland”* London. HMSO.
- Olsson, O. and Wikstrom, P. (1982) *“Effects of Experimental Saturday Closing of Liquor Retail Stores in Sweden”* **Contemporary Drug Problems** 11 325-53
- Osterberg, E. (1982) *“Recorded Consumption of Alcohol in Finland 1950-75”* Helsinki. Social Research Institute of Alcohol Studies.
- Pernanen, K. (1991) *“Alcohol in Human Violence”* New York. Guilford Press.
- Pernanen, K. (1998) *“Prevention of Alcohol-Related Violence”* **Contemporary Drug Problems** (25)
- Purser, R.M. (1995) *“Alcohol and Crime”* Submission to the All Party Group on Alcohol Misuse
- Purser, R.M. (1997) *“Prevention Approaches to Alcohol Related Crime – A Review of a Community Based Initiative From a UK Midlands City”* Birmingham. Aquarius.
- Raistrick, D., Hodgson, R. and Ritson, B. (eds) (1999) *“Tackling Alcohol Together : The Evidence Base for a UK Alcohol Policy”* London. Free Association Books.
- Ramsay, M. (1989) *“Downtown Drinkers : The Perceptions and Fears of the Public in a City Centre”* London. Home Office.
- Ramsay, M. (1990) *“Lagerland Lost? An Experiment in Keeping Drinkers off the Streets in Central Coventry and Elsewhere”* London. Home Office.
- Rehn, N., Room, R. and Edwards, G. (2001) *“Alcohol in the European Region – Consumption, Harm and Policies”* WHO Regional Office for Europe
- Reid-Howie Associates Ltd (2001) *“Towards a Plan for Action on Alcohol Misuse : Responses to the Written Consultation”* Scottish Executive, Edinburgh
- Saunders, W. (1985) *“Licensing Law, the Scottish Experiment : A Reply to Clayson”* **Triple A Review** July - August
- Save the Children Scotland (2001) *“Consultation with Children and Young People on the Scottish Executive’s Plan for Action on Alcohol Misuse”* Scottish Executive, Edinburgh
- Scottish Home and Health Department (1973) *“Report of the Departmental Committee on Scottish Licensing Law (Cmnd 5354)”* Scottish Office, Edinburgh
- Scribner, R., MackKinnon, D. and Dwyer, J. (1995) *“The Risk of Assaultive Violence and Alcohol Availability in Los Angeles County”* **American Journal of Public Health** No. 85 pp335-40
- Sewel, K. (2001) *“International Alcohol Policies : A Literature Review”* Scottish Executive, Edinburgh

- Shepherd, J. (1999) “*The Naming and Shaming Game*” **Alcohol Concern** 14:2 pp10-11
- Shepherd, J., Robinson, L. and Lvers, B. (1990) “*The Roots of Urban Violence*” **Injury** Vol 21 pp139-141
- Simons-Morton, B. and Cummings, S (1997) “*Evaluation of a Local Designated Driver and Responsible Server Program to Prevent Drinking and Driving*” **Journal of Drug Education** Vol 27(4) 321-333
- Smith, D. and Burvill, P. (1987). “*Effect on Juvenile Crime of Lowering the Drinking Age in Three Australian States*” **British Journal of Addiction** No. 82 pp181-188
- Smith, I. (1989) “*Effectiveness of Legislative and Fiscal Restrictions in reducing Alcohol Related Crime and Traffic Accidents*” **Alcohol Conference Proceedings** 223-240
- Social Issues Research Centre (2002) “*Counting the Cost : The Measurement and Recording of Alcohol-Related Violence and Disorder*” London. Produced for The Portman Group
- St John-Brookes, K (1998) “*Keeping the Peace : A Guide to the Prevention of Alcohol-Related Disorder*” London. Produced by Working Solutions for the Portman Group
- Stockwell, T. (2001) “*Responsible Alcohol Service : Lessons from Evaluations of Server Training and Policing Initiatives*” **Drug and Alcohol Review** 20 pp257-265
- Stockwell, T., Somerford, P. and Lang, E. (1992) “*The Relationship Between License Type and Alcohol Related Problems Attributed to Licensed Premises in Perth, Western Australia*” **Journal of Studies on Alcohol** No. 53 pp495-498
- Treno, A. and Holder, H. (1997) “*Community Mobilization : Evaluation of an Environmental Approach to Local Action*” **Addiction** 92 : Supplement 2 S173-S187
- Tuncks, J. (1999) “*Decriminalisation of Drunkenness*” **Alcohol and Crime**
- University of Aberdeen, HEBS and University of York (2001) “*Cost Effective Measures to Reduce Alcohol Misuse in Scotland : A Literature Review*” Scottish Executive
- Watts, R. and Rabow, J. (1983) “*Alcohol Availability and Alcohol Problems in 213 California Cities*” **Alcoholism Clinical and Experimental Research** Vol. 7 pp47-58
- Wells, S., Graham, K. and West, P. (1998) “*The Good, The Bad and The Ugly : Responses by Security Staff to Aggressive Incidents in Public Drinking Settings*” **Journal of Drug Issues** Canada. Addiction Research Foundation.
- Willner, P., Hart, K., Binmore, J., Cavendish, M. and Dunphy, E. (2000) “*Alcohol Sales to Underage Adolescents : An Unobtrusive Observational Field Study and Evaluation of a Police Intervention*” **Addiction** (2000) 95(9) 1373-1388
- Wolfson, M., Toomey, T., Murray, D., Forster, J., Short, B. and Wagenaar, A. (1996) “*Alcohol Outlet Policies and Practices Concerning Sales to Underage People*” **Addiction** 91 pp589-602.

ISSN 0950 2254
ISBN 0 7559 3514 4
Price £5.00

www.scotland.gov.uk/socialresearch

ASTRON B29106 1/03



Making it work together

